Hawai'i 2050 Sustainability Task Force Hawai'i State Capitol, Room 409 February 27, 2007 Minutes

Members Present:	Senator Russell Kokubun, Representative Pono Chong, Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland, Senator Mike Gabbard, David Goode, Marion Higa, Jeffrey Hunt, Karl Kim, Keith Kurahashi, Brad Kurokawa, Keith Rollman, Jane Testa, Laura Thielen, Stacie Thorlakson, Beth Tokioka, Senator Jill Tokuda, Representative Ryan Yamane
Members Not Present:	Representative Lyla Berg, Ian Costa, Henry Eng, Millie Kim, Representative Colleen Meyer, James Spencer, Michael Tresler,

Pamela Tumpap

I. **Call to Order.** A quorum was established to begin the meeting. The task force meeting was called to order at 1:10 p.m. by Chair Russell Kokubun on Tuesday, February 27, 2007, in Room 409 at the Hawai'i State Capitol. Introduction of task force members. Chair Kokubun welcomed the new members to the task force. Jeffrey Hunt, Maui County Planning Director, has been appointed by Mayor Charmaine Tavares to replace former Planning Director Michael Foley. Mayor Tavares also confirmed that Stacie Thorlakson and Pamela Tumpap will continue to serve as members to the task force. Brad Kurokawa, Hawai'i County Deputy Planning Director, has been appointed by Mayor Harry Kim to replace Roy Takemoto. Mr. Kurokawa is a landscape architect and is LEED certified for the U.S. Green Building Council. For 25 years, Mr. Kurokawa practiced in Seattle and San Francisco and returned to Hawai'i a couple of years ago. Chair Kokubun received a letter from Mayor Bryan Baptiste informing the task force of his appointment of Michael Tresler. Mr. Tresler is the Vice President of Grove Farm and the former Finance Director for the County of Kaua'i and is replacing Donald Fujimoto. Chair Kokubun noted that with the appointments by the county mayors, all vacancies on the task force have been filled.

Chair Kokubun also noted that although the Legislature is on recess, legislative members may need to leave the meeting to attend to committee assignments.

- II. Review and Approve Minutes. Draft minutes from the January 18, 2007 meeting were distributed to members. Chair Kokubun entertained a motion to approve the January 18, 2007 minutes. Representative Ryan Yamane moved to approve the minutes; Representative Pono Chong seconded the motion. Chair Kokubun opened discussion on the minutes. The task force unanimously approved the January 18, 2007 minutes.
- **III. Discussion and Approval of Research Activities.** Dr. Sharon Miyashiro and her University of Hawai'i team is assisting the task force with the drafting of the issue

papers. Sharon updated the task force on the issue paper drafts. The draft papers were sent to task force members by electronic mail and in hard copy. The purpose of the draft papers is to set the parameters for discussions at the community engagement meetings. The issue papers should inspire, engage, inform, and provide background information for the community meetings and beyond. Due to the short timetable, the research team would like to receive comments and edits on the draft papers in the next week and have the IssueBook finalized for print within the next two weeks. A graphics person has joined the team and will be responsible for putting the IssueBook together. If members feel that information the community should have is still missing from the draft, the authors are prepared to revise the drafts. Revisions and edits should be forwarded to Sharon within the week. The Public Information Officer from the Communications Department of the College of Tropical Agriculture and Human Resources has agreed to do the layout and design for the IssueBook.

Keith Kurahashi thought the paper on energy was well presented and the most complete. He suggested having the other papers patterned in a similar way. The paper covered what was being done today, how renewable energy sources can be expanded, and provided a list of indicators. Although subjective, he also suggested setting goals for the indicators presented.

Beth Tokioka suggested that the discussion on "Sustainable residences" in the Land Use paper should include the role utility companies should have to incite individuals to make choices in the area of sustainability. Beth also commented that the Water paper was well done and liked how the paper closed with thought-provoking questions.

Sharon responded that the authors were writing the papers to engage the community in discussion and not necessarily to provide answers. The Energy paper discussed what kinds of renewable energy were available.

Keith Kurahashi added that the papers should provide the communities a "starting point" because the communities may not be aware of the kinds of energy resources available or what could be done with water. Other ideas from the community could be added to collect the most comprehensive data for the plan.

Marion Higa asked Sharon to verify the 1988 citation in the Water paper (section under "Surface water," last sentence in the 4th paragraph) with its author to see if the statement would still hold true today with what has already been seen with recent flood damages. Marion added that the paper also suggests that we may be in danger of not having enough water despite the decline in agricultural use but read in another paper a statement that there is plenty enough water. The statements seem to contradict each other. Sharon will check with authors.

David Goode commended the research team on a job well done and had some minor comments that he would forward to the team. The papers should be as factually-based as possible.

Karl Kim commented that there are two levels to approach these issues: 1) by topic area (which may be difficult to achieve) or 2) by looking at all the essays and pulling out the pieces that could be drawn together. He also asked if the authors had the opportunity to read the Paradise Index and contribute toward the index. If they were, the result could then bring out both quantitative as well as qualitative measures. Karl suggested using the background essays as a base of knowledge from which you could identify what should or can be measured; then adopt a philosophy that is the baseline for quantitative and qualitative measures.

Chair Kokubun inquired if the Forward was purposely placed at the end of the Table of Contents. Sharon stated that placement of the Forward was sort of a "twist"—instead of having the foreword in the front, it was placed towards the back with the idea of moving "Forward." Marion Higa commented that confusion could result with the spelling of the words—forward and foreword. The common mistake when looking at the table of contents could be that the foreword is in the wrong place, but when you read the contents of the piece, you would see that it was talking about moving forward. Marion suggested adding "moving" before forward or something to make it less misleading.

Jeffrey Hunt inquired why housing wasn't included in the IssueBook. Sharon responded that the papers were based on the task force's identification of major components for a sustainable Hawai'i. The housing issue is included primarily in the quality of life paper as well as the other papers, but it may not be as in-depth some would like it to be. Chair Kokubun also added that in earlier discussions on education being a key component, the task force agreed that education should be an overarching part of each issue.

Stacie Thorlakson suggested having the Hawaii2050 website visible in the IssueBook and also inquired on the possibility of an audio version of the IssueBook.

Chair Kokubun commented that he appreciated the hard work received from Sharon and added that one of the main emphasis of the task force's work is the future. In initial discussions with the task force, Dr. Jim Dator wanted to stimulate imagination and discussion about the future. Chair Kokubun feels that "The Future: A Call to Action" piece would not stimulate the community as it should. This piece should also emphasize to those participating that they should be very imaginative and not think of the crisis of today or tomorrow but think about what Hawai'i should be like in the far future (2050). Sharon responded by saying more could be added to what is already there and would seek assistance in writing the added piece. Chair Kokubun asked Doc (Paul) Berry if he would agree to assist in writing the additional piece. Doc Berry agreed.

Representative Pono Chong commented on whether this would be a good place for the leap into action. Looking at it, it's more of a first step of a piece—the foundation, a good technical piece—but not sure if that is where the springboard should be. He is unsure if the call for action is for this document or for something else. Chair Kokubun commented that he recalls that when Dr. Dator first came to assist us with this project, he really emphasized the fact that we should not restrict ourselves in terms of how we think about the future. Chair Kokubun shared his concerns that we not look at these issues in the

context of 2007 or 2010, but in the context of 2050. Sharon suggested that a place to include the call for action could be in the "About This Book" section at the beginning of the IssueBook. The piece could explain why the year 2050 was chosen and the data given would set the motion for the future. Bill Kaneko suggested that Chair Kokubun present it as an introductory prospective on behalf of the task force. He and Doc Berry could assist in the writing.

Representative Ryan Yamane suggested that since people are being asked to think of ideas, could blank pages be included in the back of the book where their ideas or notes could be written.

Karl Kim recently read what the world would be like in the year 2050. The population will reach 10.9 billion and there will be much disparity in the world. He commented that one thing that seems to be missing is what is happening in the world, the global challenges that our planet is facing. The papers are Hawai'i-oriented but we are part of a larger system. Doc Berry added that global warming will dominate the future.

Beth Tokioka commented that most individuals will not read the book cover-to-cover. The book should begin with a compelling, mind-opening message. She also suggested having a section at the end of each paper summarizing the major issues, what readers should think about the issues, a call to action, and a place to write their thoughts.

Representative Pono Chong had some concerns with using fear, whether scientifically plausible, provable, or true, to engage individuals in thinking about the future. It would not be a good framework to start this project. Sharon added that the context being put forward is that although there are challenges, there are also choices.

Brad Kurokawa commented that sustainability is such a broad and varied topic and when presented in lots of different levels, from the principles to actions to indicators, most individuals do not have a grasp on this kind of framework. If there is not a clear platform of discussion, it becomes very challenging and overwhelming. He also has concerns with the "Dooms Day" scenario and added that while living in Seattle he has seen the shift from no recycling to "where is the recycling bin?" and has come to the conclusion that the journey to sustainability is self-awareness—recognition of "what is" and then, "what are the options" and done in a way that is inspiring to make choices.

Chair Kokubun reminded members that the IssueBook was not a stand-alone piece, but will be used together with the community engagement process.

Jeffrey Hunt also agreed that the "Dooms Day" approach is inappropriate. This document should inspire us and say "here's where we want to be." We make these choices because it is the right thing to do and not because we fear that if we don't, this is what will happen.

Chair Kokubun agreed, but believes that fear was not intended to be used to engage discussions and that "fear" is the wrong word to use. At meetings held throughout the

state, the community voiced deep concerns about the future, particularly on the issues of food and energy. We can be pessimistic given those concerns but we can also be optimistic if we have the right tools and opportunities before us.

Sharon requested that members forward comments to her by the end of the week, March 1.

IV. Update of Community Engagement Working Group Activities. Leland Chang updated the task force on Phase I of the community engagement activities. A copy of the Community Meeting Tool Kit was distributed to members and is available for downloading from the Hawaii2050 website for individuals who may want to host smaller meetings. An online survey has also been posted to the Hawaii2050 website and as of February 19th, couple hundred responses to the survey have been received. Island coordinators reported that 180 to 200 small group meetings have been planned for the month of March statewide. Island coordinators are being asked to complete all meetings by the end of March so information collected can be analyzed and prepare for Phase II. All members are encouraged to view and participate in the survey and inform their constituents, associates, friends, etc. that information on sponsoring and hosting a meeting can be found at the Hawaii2050 website.

Chair Kokubun clarified that the approximately 200 small group meetings being held in March will not have the benefit of the issue papers. Leland responded that these meetings are still part of Phase I of community engagement and that the tool kit is geared towards definition, vision, and guiding principles of sustainability. These meetings are smaller versions of the community meetings held earlier.

Janis Reischmann reported on Phase II of community engagement. Members serving on the Community Engagement Working Group are Keith Rollman, Representative Lyla Berg, Stacie Thorlakson, Jane Testa, and Beth Tokioka. Phase II focuses on goals, highlevel strategies, and measurements or indicators. Phase II will follow the same format as Phase I but with a different content and the use of the issue papers. A series of 12 community meetings will be held throughout the state—multiple meetings on all islands except on Moloka'i and Lāna'i where there will be one meeting each. These meetings will be held in the month of April and through the first week of May.

The next phase of community meetings will consist of generating ideas on choices, strategies, and indicators. The IssueBook will also be used at these meetings. These meetings will draw upon the facts, issues, and questions outlined in the IssueBook and use them as the starting point for discussion about goals, strategies, and indicators. In addition, Phase II will confirm what has come out of Phase I. Participants will be asked to validate the comments made at the Phase I meetings on definition, vision, and guiding principles. At the conclusion of the series of community meetings, a second tool kit and web survey will be developed. Individuals would be allowed to respond in the same manner as in Phase I. Phase II needs to be completed by June 30, 2007.

Chair Kokubun asked if the tool kit distributed earlier was the Phase I tool kit and if so would the tool kit for Phase II be essentially the same. Janis responded saying that the survey will be different. The survey will ask questions which came out of the Phase II meetings. Janis also noted that when thinking of indicators, there is the IssueBook, but there are also other indicators projects going on throughout the State—Focus Maui Nui, Kaua'i Planning and Action Alliance, and Hawai'i island has collected data on energy use.

Leland shared thoughts from the working group that this process should be kept positive and forward looking. While we need to take from the issue papers the important realities and questions, we need to present the possibilities and always keep in the forefront that things could change radically from what we know is possible now to what will be possible 30 years from now. The working group would also like to receive input from the community on all issues presented in the IssueBook. Janis further commented that instead of having discussions only on land use or water or quality of life, discussions should be centered around all the issues and how they intersect. The CE working group has been asked to present the IssueBook visually to the extent possible—so many words can be overwhelming to people. Another suggestion was presenting the facts through storytelling.

Keith Kurahashi suggested on having an executive summary. It is important that the issue papers be comprehensive and not condensed. The executive summary could highlight the important issues on each paper.

Senator Jill Tokuda asked how the tool kits were being disseminated. Janis responded saying the island coordinators are the primary distributors of the tool kits. How each coordinator distributes the kits will vary from island to island. There will also be a statewide press release. Senator Mike Gabbard asked if there has been outreach to faith-based communities. Janis responded that they are on the list of groups island coordinators will outreach to but could not give a response to the number of groups reached. Senator Gabbard volunteered to assist in reaching out to his network of churches. Beth Tokioka asked if members could receive a pdf version of the tool kit to distribute to their constituents.

Island Coordinators:	Hawai'i Island, Alex Frost
	Kaua'i, Diane Zachary
	Lāna'i, Alberta deJetley
	Maui, Jeanne Skog and Tom Blackburn Rodrigues
	Moloka'i, Glen Teves
	O'ahu, Bob Agres and Derek Kiyabu

Bill Kaneko updated the task force on the database. Mille Kim informed him that individuals who attended the Hawai'i island meetings have been contacting her via email asking "what happening?" A database of approximately 3,000 names and addresses and 2,000 emails have been purchased and will be put onto the system. The database will be used to disseminate information more productively.

Jeanne Schultz Afuvai updated members on the status of the Kids focus groups. Ward Research, together with the Department of Education and the Student Member of the Board of Education, is working on gathering high schools students for the focus group. Hawai'i Kids Voting will use the information to seek input from Hawai'i's youths.

Chair Kokubun announced plans for conducting two statewide surveys—one early in the process and the other just before the plan is submitted to the Legislature. The survey will be used to keep us on track and to confirm that the direction we are moving toward is shared with the general population. Estimated costs for conducting both surveys would be approximately \$50,000. Contributions from the private sector have been received to fund the surveys. Sponsorships have been received by Pacific Resource Partners (Carpenter's Union), Kamehameha Schools, and Castle & Cooke.

Bill Kaneko reviewed a sampling of past and planned community activities (summary sheet distributed to members). Chair Kokubun noted the distribution of the Winter 2007 issue of *People's Pulse* which presented the results of their own sustainability survey. He recommended that member take a look at the results. Beth Tokioka commented that individuals sampled in the survey seemed to be interested in their own self-sufficiency. Individuals seemed focused on economics—being able to live a comfortable life, having a nice home, and having a good job. Compared to comments made at the various community meetings where concerns were about the environment, agriculture, etc., it would be interesting to see who were sampled in the survey. Chair Kokubun added that when they inquired about the survey, they were informed that about 700 people across the state were sampled at random. Laura Thielen commented that in the past ten years, although Hawai'i has seen a population growth, there has been a net loss of individuals of child-bearing age. Her interpretation of the survey was that many individuals are finding it difficult to live here and how do we sustain a culture where their children can afford to stay and live in Hawai'i.

Bill Kaneko informed the task force on the Hawai'i 2050 Business Leadership Council. As part of the Community Engagement Working Group, the council was established. Through the generosity of Bennette Evangelista of Actus Lend Lease, she is bringing their CEO for Lend Lease Development - US, Michael Bellaman, to be a speaker at the March 8 meeting of Hawai'i's top business leaders. Mitch Dolier of Kaneohe Ranch has agreed to co-chair this event along with Chair Kokubun.

V. Report of the Public Education Work Group. Pamela Tumpap had put together a Public Awareness Plan that was distributed to the task force. Bill Kaneko commented that the plan would outline how to better educate the public on the task force's efforts as well as on sustainability as a whole. This plan would be the policy call for the task force in terms of how much resources should be invested in this session to get the message out about the plan. Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland suggested creating a working relationship with the media—radio, television, newspaper, etc.—similar to that of the business community, to generate sponsored public awareness. Bill introduced the newest member of his staff, Patrick Williams, who has a communications background and could assist in seeking media partners.

After the working group was created, its name became confused with DOE's K-12 or P to 20 educational aspect of the task force. To lessen the confusion, Chair Kokubun entertained a motion to have the Public Education Working Group's name changed to the Public Awareness Work Group. Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland moved to have the working group's name changed, Jane Testa seconded the motion. The task force unanimously approved to have the name changed to the Public Awareness Work Group.

Jeanne Schultz Afuvai announced that the Island Insights program aired on Christmas Day will be rebroadcast in April.

Chair Kokubun along with Bill Kaneko met with Jeanne Mariani-Belding, editor for the Honolulu Advertiser. Bill informed the task force that the Advertiser is interested in having web blogs, year-long features on sustainability, links on their website to the Hawaii2050 website, and possibly doing a Hawai'i 2050 Conference, in the same tradition as the Hawai'i 2000 Conference held 30 years ago.

VI. Discussion of the Accountability Work Group. Chair Kokubun commented on the creation of a new working group to develop the mechanism for implementation of the sustainability plan. This working group would also develop the measurements for reaching certain indicators and an annual evaluation of the plan itself. The work of this group will need to be completed by June 30, 2007. Chair Kokubun would like the membership of this group to be a neutral body—not government watching government or task force members overseeing themselves—and asked members if they would allow him to select members for this working group. No objections from members. Chair Kokubun entertained a motion to create the Accountability Work Group and allow the membership to be at the discretion of the Chair. Beth Tokioka moved to create the Accountability Work Group with its membership to be at the discretion of the chair. Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved by the task force.

Thomas Smyth, a member of the audience, asked to address the task force. Mr. Smyth is the Business/Industry Development Administrator for Business & Community Development Branch of the Department of Business, Economic Development and Tourism. He started with state government when the State and Functional Plans were being implemented and was directly involved with the last two functional plans. He cautioned the task force in using Chapter 226, HRS, as a guide for developing the sustainability plan. He believes two reasons why the plans fells apart were that (1) major mandates were put upon the counties with no money to carry out the mandates and (2) at the state-level, reporting mandates were burdensome and created so much paperwork that staff could not keep up with the reporting.

VII. Update and Discussion of Other Sustainability Activities. Bill Kaneko updated members on the Hawai'i Business 2050 Series on Sustainability. About a hundred

participants attended the first of the eight-part series which was an overview of sustainability. The second of the eight-part series will be held on March 16 and will feature The Honorable Harry Kim, Mayor of Hawai'i County; David Bylund, Chair, Urban Land Institute Sustainability Committee; and Michael Jones, Division President, D.R. Horton – Hawai'i Division.

The State Office of Planning and the UH Pacific Business Center Program are co-hosting the Sustainable Entrepreneurial Development Conference in Urban and Rural Areas. The conference will run from Tuesday, February 27 through Thursday, March 1 at the Hilton Hawaiian Village.

Chair Kokubun distributed a list of senate bills that relate to or have an impact on sustainability issues. He will work with House members to produce a list of house bills. Chair Kokubun did a presentation on these bills to the Senate Majority Caucus. The Chair will do a similar presentation to the House Majority Caucus on March 9. He will be joined by Bill Kaneko, Marion Higa, James Koshiba, and Ramsay Taum. Chair Kokubun highlighted S.B. 844 from the list of bills. S.B. 844 is the measure that appropriates funding for the task force. The appropriation is still a blank appropriation and will probably remain blank until all appropriation measures can be assessed. The minimum appropriation that will be sought is \$650,000, the other half of the original \$1.3 million requested last legislative session. However, with the discussion of various public awareness efforts, the appropriation will probably be increased. Chair Kokubun also highlighted S.B. 1925 regarding to sustainable communities. This bill would provide permitting incentives for developing model sustainable communities. The life span of this bill would be for 5 years.

Beth Tokioka shared an interesting event that was happening on Kaua'i that afternoon relating to generating energy onsite. The Public Utilities Commission is holding a hearing on the county's electric utility's proposal to request an increase in stand-by charges. The proposal is for the stand-by rate to be increased from \$5 to \$35. Ironically, the county was ready to award a contract for a photo voltaic system for their county facilities but is now holding off on the award because if the proposed stand-by charges, which relate to self-generating projects, are approved; it would cost the county an extra \$100,000 a year to run the system. If the PUC grants the request, it could kill other self-generated renewable projects on Kaua'i. It is important that when you promote sustainable programs, all entities and agencies involved need to be supportive of the overall goals. Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland suggested that part of the role of the Accountability Work Group could be to identify possible conflicts in policies and raise them with entities that will be making important decisions.

The Chair is also proposing to hold a Mayors' Summit sometime in the Summer or Fall of 2007 for county officials to come together and propose their ideas on sustainability.

VIII. Report on Stakeholder Outreach. The task force continues to reach out to various organizations throughout the state. Meetings have been or are being arranged with Kamehameha Schools, AFL-CIO, Pacific Resources Partnerships, and others. Senator



Suzanne Chun Oakland suggested having these outreach groups utilize the Community Engagement Took Kit.

- **IX.** Next Steps; Plan for Future Meetings. Chair Kokubun suggested scheduling the next task force meeting on a legislative recess day. The next meeting is tentatively scheduled for Wednesday, March 28, 2007, from 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m. Task force members will be notified on the location for the meeting.
- **X. Adjourn.** Chair Kokubun thanked members of the task force and the audience for attending the meeting. The meeting was adjourned at 3:09 p.m. by Chair Kokubun.