

**Hawai'i 2050 Sustainability Task Force
Hawai'i State Capitol, Room 414
October 16, 2007
Minutes**

Members Present: Senator Russell Kokubun, Representative Lyla Berg, Representative Pono Chong, Ian Costa, David Goode, Marion Higa, Keith Kurahashi, Senator Ron Menor, Keith Rollman, James Spencer, Jane Testa, Stacie Thorlakson, Beth Tokioka, Senator Jill Tokuda, Representative Ryan Yamane

Members Not Present: Henry Eng, Senator Mike Gabbard, Jeffrey Hunt, Karl Kim, Millie Kim, Brad Kurokawa, Representative Colleen Meyer, Michael Tresler, Pamela Tumpap

- I. **Call to Order.** A quorum was established and Chair Russell Kokubun call the meeting of the Hawai'i 2050 Sustainability Task Force to order at 1:29 p.m. on Tuesday, October 16, 2007 at the Hawai'i State Capitol in Room 414.
- II. **Review and Approve of Minutes.** Chair Russell Kokubun entertained a motion to approve minutes from the August 16, 2007 and September 13, 2007 task force meetings. Jane Testa moved to approve the minutes from the August 16th and September 13th meetings, Representative Ryan Yamane seconded the motion. Chair Kokubun opened discussion on the minutes. The task force unanimously approved the minutes from the August 16, 2007 and September 13, 2007 meetings. Chair Kokubun asked members if there were any objections to discussing agenda items out of order and moving forward to agenda item VII, Legislative Work Group. Task force members had no objections.
- III. **Hawai'i 2050 Summit Update.** Chair Russell Kokubun thanked task force members for their participation in the Summit. He also thanked task force members and members of the public who were presenters in the program and added that he is receiving favorable comments on the Summit. Jeanne Schultz Afuvai reported on the Hawai'i 2050 Sustainability Summit that was held on September 22, 2007 at the Hilton Hawaiian Village. There were 914 participants in attendance at the Summit, 70 of which were students. Jeanne expressed her appreciation to those involved in awarding the scholarships. A total of 135 scholarships were provided to residents statewide. Scholarships provided airfare and registration fees for neighbor island recipients and registration fees for O'ahu recipients. Jeanne also extended her appreciation to task force members and community leaders for presenting the plan, Gail Sagara from Chair Kokubun's office for recruiting and coordinating approximately 25 volunteers who assisted in a variety of tasks; Amy Agbayani and her 12 volunteers for helping with registration check in; Joanne Watase-Yang and her 3 volunteers who helped with various duties; Susan Oshiro who coordinated the Summit registrations; and the Hawaiian Electric Company for donating reusable green bags for all attendees. Transportation was

provided for participants arriving from the neighbor islands. Volunteers were stationed at both the airport and Summit site providing directions. Forty participants used the morning service from the airport to the hotel and 20 used the afternoon service back to the airport. Although ridership was low, participants were very appreciative of the service. Jeanne acknowledged Patrick Williams of HIPA for coordinating with Capitol TV to run a live, closed-caption broadcast of the Summit. Rebroadcasts of the Summit have already been shown on the neighbor islands. Patrick also coordinated pre- and post-event media coverage of the Summit. Water glasses used at the water stations were made from corn and 100% compostable and napkins were made from 100% recycled paper. Floral arrangements were disassembled and taken to Kawaiahaʻo Church for their Sunday morning services. Jeanne again thanked Chair Kokubun for his leadership and everyone involved with the Summit. Stacie Thorlakson, on behalf of the task force, volunteers, and participants, thanked Jeanne for her work organizing the Summit.

- IV. Youth Summit Update.** Chair Russell Kokubun thanked Gail Mukaihata Hannemann and Barbara Blomgren from Girl Scouts of Hawaiʻi for organizing the Hawaiʻi 2050 Youth Sustainability Summit which was held on Friday, September 21, 2007 at the Neal Blaisdell Center. Gail thanked the task force for providing the opportunity to be part of the sustainability effort and presented a brief report on the Youth Summit. There were 217 student participants from various public, private, and charter schools. Thirty-eight adults from public, private, and charter schools, City and County Youth Board, DOE state offices, University of Hawaiʻi at Mānoa, and Leeward Community College also attended. Gail commented that she believes they had a very successful day with great group participation. One of their goals was to reach as many students as possible throughout the State. Response from the schools was better than expected, although the time between the appropriation being passed and the date of the Youth Summit was short. She acknowledged the outstanding cooperation from the schools in registering their students for the Youth Summit. Organizers knew from the start that everything could not be accomplished in one day and met with the county mayors and community leaders seeking their support that once the Youth Summit was over, students could go back to their schools, elected officials, or community should they have any questions or interest in becoming more involved.

Gail commented that one challenge they faced was that dealing with children is much different from dealing with adults and a lot of time was spent developing the right program. Because the subject matter is complex and everyone brings different ideas and experiences to the table, they decided to have the students think about what it means to be sustainable, what drives their decisions for the future, and how to move forward. Gail noted that one comment students voiced throughout this Youth Summit was that they do not see themselves living in Hawaiʻi in the future. The students were asked questions similar to those posed to the adults at the community meetings and their responses and priorities were very similar to their adult counterparts. Students were very interested in the sustainability effort and expressed interest in becoming an active part in the legislative process. They were concerned with their future and wanted to be part of the solution. Students suggested that for the upcoming session, legislators hold a Youth Sustainability Day and introduce legislation that resonates with students that they can

follow and track. A report on the data collected at the Youth Summit will be provided to the task force.

Gail appreciated the cooperation received from teachers and administrations and acknowledged the working partnership with the Office of the Auditor, Hawai'i Institute for Public Affairs, and the Hawai'i 2050 Sustainability Task Force. She also thanked the county mayors and the corporate sponsors of the Youth Summit.

- V. Community Engagement Update.** Leland Chang presented an update on the community engagement meetings being conducted throughout the State. Eleven meetings have been completed so far with a total of approximately 400 individuals in attendance. Although the attendance is slightly lower than previous rounds of community engagement, enthusiasm was still high. Leland thanked task force members for their participation at the meetings and gave special recognition to Stacie Thorlakson and Senator Jill Tokuda who were on the receiving end of some “uncalled for hits” at two of the meetings. He also recognized Patrick Williams for coordinating media coverage for the meetings, coordinating members’ schedules, and scripting and producing the PowerPoint presentations. Leland acknowledged the assistance of island coordinators in preparing the meeting sites on their respective islands. Chair Russell Kokubun, Lea Hong, Jim Tollefson, and Susan Doyle will appear on a PBS Island Insights program to be aired on October 25th. Leland and Janis Reischmann will submit a community engagement report to the task force on November 5. Online comments on the draft plan will be accepted through November 10. Chair Kokubun commented that the conversations taking place at the meetings were very thoughtful and focused. Having task force members available to immediately respond to questions was very helpful to the community.

Jim Dannemiller from SMS Research reported that both the telephone and online surveys have been completed and pretested. The telephone survey will begin tonight and will focus on the Plan and Sustainability Council. The web survey will be available online shortly. Results of both surveys will be submitted to the task force in November. Representative Pono Chong inquired on the purpose of the surveys. Chair Kokubun responded that the surveys will focus on specific parts of the draft plan. Representative Chong commented that the data collected would show whether or not we are the right track. Chair Kokubun agreed. Representative Chong further commented that it would be difficult for individuals participating in the telephone survey to judge a plan out of context and piecemeal. Jim agreed but added, for that reason, specific points or “flash points” were chosen. For example, individuals would be asked questions on issues such as Native Hawaiian issues, living wages, smart growth, diversification, etc. Chair Kokubun commented that the questions reflect the strategic actions in the plan. Jim noted that the telephone survey also focuses on the Sustainability Council—creation, composition, etc. Representative Chong questioned whether the survey and data were needed. Chair Kokubun responded that, like the first survey, the data will show whether the general population confirms or reaffirms that we are moving in the right direction. James Spencer commented that the purpose of the survey may not necessarily be to receive input on what needs to be done, but to understand where problems may arise and

the need for more engagement if necessary, why certain choices were made, and what impact it has at the community level. Senator Tokuda suggested that it may be helpful if the task force had a copy of the survey questions and inquired if the surveys were identical. Jim responded that both surveys are very different. Bill Kaneko noted that the surveys could be emailed to members.

Representative Chong asked if the data from the community meetings and surveys will be posted on the website. Chair Kokubun responded yes. Bill added that the data collected from the Youth Summit will also be posted on the website. Using touch screens, students at the Youth Summit responded to similar questions asked in the Phase I survey. The Girl Scouts, together with Hawai'i Kids Voting, are currently conducting a statewide survey of youths. Results from that survey will also be submitted to the task force.

Representative Chong surveyed task force members if they noticed situations at the community meetings where a participant's comments on issues were contradictory. For example, an attendee commented that Hawai'i is the worst state for business, but later when discussing corporate responsibility, the same person commented that there should be more mandates on corporations. Representative Chong understands that results would show only the comments made and not who made them, but wondered if other members noticed this—comments that people want open spaces but they also want affordable housing, etc. Beth Tokioka believes that peoples still haven't grasped the concept of "trade-offs," we're still in a phase where they want everything. Chair Kokubun commented that at one of the meetings, one of the concerns was that the goals were set up in silos and there wasn't a concept of interaction, which would end up in trade-offs. A suggestion presented was to communicate the concept visually, but that could be a challenge. Representative Chong shared that at a meeting the night before, one person commented that the plan was contradictory and another person responded that that was part of life. James Spencer commented that the North Shore attendees had similar concerns and in response to contradictory views like protecting our environment but utilizing our natural resources to get the best jobs, someone suggested doing simple things like getting grocery stores to discontinue using plastic bags then everyone could see the value from both sides. Jane Testa commented that people would feel validated if parts of their conversation could be translated into a vision statement that cuts across the issues identified. Beth commented that people still need to get past the order of the strategic actions to understand the plan. The numbers have nothing to do with the importance of the action. Beth added that the plan stills needs work to make it more understandable. Representative Chong apologized for revisiting his concerns of how the plan is written, who will read the plan, and the purpose of the plan. He is still unclear on who the plan is for because that would dictate what goes into the plan. Jane questioned if someone was preparing an analysis of all the comments made at the community meetings for continued discussion by the task force. Chair Kokubun responded that Leland and Janis will be presenting a report to the task force as they did for the first phase of community meetings. Bill added that, like the first phase of community engagement, the task force will be presented reports on community engagement, telephone and web surveys, polls, and the youth survey for consideration. Representative Chong asked if everyone had a clear understanding of who the plan is to serve—is it for policymakers. If

the plan is for elected officials, then the plan should have specific actions included rather than if used only as a guiding document. Chair Kokubun asked Representative Chong if the plan is written for him as a policymaker, what essential items should be included. Representative Chong responded that there should be a lot of historical and projected data. Keith Kurahashi commented that the goal of the task force is to develop a plan that is for the legislature, policymakers, private sector, and individuals to look at and grade ourselves to see if we are reaching our goals. Keith Rollman believes that the plan is intended to be used as a tool to help shape policy. James suggested that the plan could be formatted in a way that everyone could use as a tool. For example, the plan could include appendixes which provide additional data in helping various sectors understand the plan. Beth commented that the plan should include actions that can be done today that doesn't involve policy, actions clear enough for policymakers to implement, and also actions for the future, although unclear if they are reachable. Bill commented that those concerns are being raised that the community meetings—what do we need to do now to get to 2050. Keith Rollman added that those comments were also strong at the Youth Summit—they want to see some immediate actions to convince them of the efforts towards a sustainable 2050.

- VI. Stakeholder Outreach.** Bill Kaneko reported that they will again meet with the major stakeholder groups as they did in the first phase—Kanaka Maoli, Community Services, Environmentalists, Labor, and Business Organizations. Bill added that they would like to formalize youth participation in this effort. As a follow-up to the meeting with Kamehameha Schools and others, Chair Russell Kokubun and Bill met with Jim Scott of Punahou School and will meet with Superintendent Pat Hamamoto, Robert Witt, Executive Director of Hawai'i Association of Independent Schools, and others on October 30 on how to engage our youths in providing more input and participating in the upcoming legislative session.

Marion Higa reported on her participation at the annual meeting of Malama o Mānoa, an environment focus group in Mānoa. She was invited to speak about the sustainability plan. Marion reported that the meeting went well with about 60-65 people in attendance, some of which also attended the Summit. The comments voiced were very thoughtful and conform to those heard at other community meetings. There was a lot of interest in getting involved in the process and in the Sustainability Council. There was also some skepticism on whether the Council would have much authority and questioned its membership. There was some concern that the 5-year interval for reporting was too infrequent. Marion clarified that the intent is for the Council to be more active during the years between the issuance of the report cards. Attendees voiced concerns that education should have a goal of its own and not enough attention was paid on education. One participant inquired if the revenue sources would be taking funds from other programs. Marion responded that it might or might not, depending on the revenue source, but the hope would be that this is worth it or that the funding source would be self-sustaining. Many of the comments were similar to those at other community meetings and some novel to this community.

VII. Legislative Work Group. Chair Russell Kokubun commented that at the last meeting, the task force discussed the need to establish a legislative working group to review proposed legislation which would be generated by the sustainability plan and report back to the task force. The task force would seek the assistance of the Legislative Reference Bureau to draft the proposed legislation. Chair Kokubun also asked members if they would allow him the discretion to name the members to this working group. Members were encouraged to volunteer to serve on the working group or recommend individuals to the Chair. No more than 12 members (task force and non task force) are allowed to serve on the working group. Chair Kokubun entertained a motion to establish a Legislative Work Group whose members will be selected at the discretion of the Chair and will report back to the task force at the November and December meetings on any proposed legislation. A description of the working group was provided to the task force. Representative Pono Chong inquired on the type of individuals the Chair would be seeking outside of the task force. Chair Kokubun responded that non task force members could come from the various interest areas set forth in the goals and added he would entertain any suggestions from task force members. Senator Jill Tokuda moved to establish a Legislative Work Group, Representative Ryan Yamane seconded the motion. The task force unanimously approved to establish a Legislative Work Group whose members will be selected at the discretion of the Chair and will report back to the task force at the November and December meetings on the progress of any proposed legislation. Chair Kokubun again encouraged members to volunteer for the working group or recommend individuals to serve on the working group.

VIII. Final Plan Update. Bill Kaneko reviewed the final timeline for the plan which was distributed to the task force. As reported by Leland Chang, 11 community engagement meetings have been completed with two more O'ahu meetings to be held. Once all meetings are completed, Leland and Janis Reischmann will begin analyzing the data collected. SMS Research will prepare reports on the phone survey and web poll. All reports are to be submitted to HIPA by November 5 and then forwarded to the task force prior to the November 13th meeting. The task force will discuss the reports at the November 13th meeting. Final revisions to the plan will follow and the task force will review and approve the final plan at the December 14th meeting. The final plan will be submitted to the legislature on December 21st. Jeanne Schultz Afuvai clarified that the November meeting was originally scheduled for the 15th but was moved to the 13th to meet internal deadlines. The November 13th meeting is scheduled from 1:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m. David Goode commented that this meeting appears to be pivotal in approving the plan and has concerns that more time may be needed if the input from the community differs significantly from the draft plan. He is willing to schedule a whole day for the meeting and stay as long as needed to approve the plan. Bill clarified that at the November 13th meeting, the task force will be providing HIPA with general guidance in terms of where changes or more emphasis are needed in the plan. The final plan will then be approved at the December 14th meeting. Bill commented that a copy of the final plan could be forwarded to members prior to December 14 or the task force could schedule another meeting between November 13 and December 14. Beth Tokioka commented that the task force should have general consensus of the plan at the end of the November meeting in order to approve a final plan in December. Chair Russell Kokubun suggested

convening the November 13th meeting at 11:00 a.m. Senator Jill Tokuda suggested tentatively scheduling a meeting between the November and December meetings to address concerns that may arise from the community meetings and the various surveys and polls. Chair Kokubun recommended the following schedule of meetings: November 13th, 11:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.; December 7th, 1:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m. (only if necessary); and December 14th, 1:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m. Beth inquired if the CE report scheduled to be transmitted to the task force on November 9th could identify issues that could significantly change the plan.

Bill distributed to members a handout that identifies available data sources for the indicators in the plan. Jane Testa inquired whether the indicators with no data sources can be measured. Bill responded that for the indicators that do not have data sources, a survey instrument or measurement needs to be designed to capture the data. James Spencer inquired if there was a category that would identify whether the data sources are short- or long-term. Bill responded that the intent of the five-year review would be to see if the indicators are still relevant or if they need to be changed. Representative Chong suggested checking with the federal government for data collected on energy issues. Representative Chong also commented that if the plan is to be used as a guide to implement policy to move towards the goals, thought needs to be put into the fact that if the goals are reached using the indicators, will we be achieving what we want. Representative Lyla Berg questioned if the destination we are trying to achieve is 100 percent. Bill responded that benchmarks have not yet been agreed upon. There are no benchmarks, only indicators and he feels that the task force does not have the expertise to determine what is reasonable in 5 or 10 years. For the education related indicators with no data sources, Representative Berg suggested re-phrasing them so that they are measurable with data that is already being collected by the DOE. Chair Kokubun noted that they could discuss the issue at the upcoming meeting with school officials. Jane inquired if it can be assumed that “statewide” under the “Islands covered” column means the data can be broken down by county also. Bill could not provide an answer but will find out. James commented on the timeline for the process for which the indicators are finalized in the plan and is there a process in which all indicators are checked so that they are not duplicated in other goals. Chair Kokubun responded that November 13 is when the indicators need to be finalized. David Goode commented that the key focus area for the Sustainability Council would be to continually review the indicators to see if they are appropriate to achieve the goals.

- IX. Schedule.** Bill Kaneko presented the timeline for the whole project which was also distributed to members.
- X. Report on Other Activities.** Chair Russell Kokubun announced the fifth in a series of breakfast forums. The forum, “High Tech: A Hope-Filled Future,” will be held on October 24th from 8:00 a.m. to 9:30 a.m. at the Hawai‘i Prince Hotel. Panelists for the forum are: Jennifer Sabas, Chief of Staff to Senator Inouye; Dr. Patrick Sullivan, Founder of Hoana Medical and Oceanit; and Nelson Kanemoto, President of Referentia.

Patrick Williams commented on the media attention received since the draft plan was presented at the Summit. The sustainability efforts were featured in the October 11 issue of the American Institute of Architecture's newsletter. Patrick reported that there have been three times as many hits on the H2050 website since the draft plan was presented at the Summit—over 10,000 hits since September 22. The draft plan itself has been downloaded about 670 times. Most of the hits are from the United States but hits have also come from all over the world—Brazil, France, Germany, Poland, Argentina, Mexico. Patrick also confirmed an appearance on PBS Island Insights on October 25th and is also working to see if a youth component can be added to that broadcast or have a separate one.

Marion Higa shared an article in the most recent issue of the Punahou Bulletin. The article is about Punahou's sustainability curriculum and a student leader's participation in the Summit and how he credits the Summit for sparking his interest in the sustainability movement.

- XI. Next Steps; Plan for Future Meetings.** Upcoming meetings are scheduled for Tuesday, November 13, 2007 from 11:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. and Friday, December 14, 2007 from 1:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m. Members were also asked to tentatively reserve Friday, December 7, 2007 from 1:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m. for a task force meeting in case all issues cannot be addressed at the November 13th meeting.

Senator Ron Menor expressed his appreciation to Bill Kaneko and the HIPA staff for being very responsive to the legislators of the task force and the residents of their communities in scheduling the community meetings so they can provide comment and input on the plan.

- XII. Adjourn.** Chair Kokubun thanked all members for attending today's meeting and for their continued support of the task force's efforts. He also thanked members of the audience for their continued participation. The meeting was adjourned at 3:12 p.m.