

Response to the Visual Montage: What is rural to you?

Rural is...

- Older developments
- Purpose-built
- Organic development of rural towns
- Small scale villages
- Rural is chop suey
- Open space
- Is rural antiquated?
- Large lots are okay as long as they're doing some ag
- Family agriculture
- Family living above store ("house" over "store" can be rural, but "house" over "house" is not rural)

Rural is not...

- Manicured lawns
- Giant house
- Vertical curbs and gutters—design details are not rural
- Sidewalks
- Markings lanes on street
- Large-scale town centers
- Signage
- Curbs
- Urban development in rural areas

What's important about rural to you?

- Forested areas
- Maintain narrower roadways (buses not allowed)
- Not for wealthy only
- How to expedite the process, so we can achieve the vision/realize the vision for rural
- Community that's good for all families, no matter what your socioeconomic status is or cultural/racial background is
- Open space
- Open space, keeping countryside natural, no giant houses up on mountainside – giant houses do not fit.
- Less stress
- Functional working landscape with balance between agriculture and residential
- Enough development already on my island (keep Molokai, Molokai)
- Preserving open space for future generations
- Rural architecture/form
- Rural contributes to self-sufficiency/sustainability of islands
- Very low intensity land use
- Maintaining continuity of cultural values of rural areas
- Sense of place
- Way of life: local mindset, traditional life (style)
- Preservation of a way of life: traditional
- Low population density
- Family subsistence, farm activity, affordable workforce housing
- Keeping night sky dark
- Walkable, able to access mountains (like for hunting/fishing), less cars
- Preserving natural areas, especially hydrology, not paving over with impervious surfaces
- Ahupua`a concept: mauka to makai
- Preserving lifestyle: ohana – keep as part of lifestyle
- NOT gentleman estates, keep to 1,200 sq. ft.
- Not for wealthy only
- Country next to town
- Maintain integrity of countryside: agricultural economy, open spaces
- Hybrid of urban and agricultural, but less of both; more community living, based on ecological values
- Maui as a community of small towns
- Opportunity to enjoy natural features of island
- Green on both sides of road, not houses up to road – look of it, can pull off road

What questions do you have about preserving and maintaining rural areas?

- Wahi pana: our spiritual places, how do you preserve the cultural and spiritual values and places when development occurs?
- How do you support subsistence living for rural peoples?
- How do you preserve and reflect the history and values of people living in rural places like Molokai?
- How can we change laws that govern liability on private lands? To deal with landowner concerns for allowing access?
- How can we plan our future projects in a sustainable way? Like a closed loop system.
- How can you keep tour vehicles/buses off rural roads?
- How can you reward or incentivize system to do “appropriate” rural development/good development? (shortening time is an incentive)
- How do you keep rural rural?
- How do you achieve discipline/continuity in plan/vision over time?
- How do you deal with existing entitlements already out there?
- How do we maintain shoreline access, reestablishing or maintaining access agreements? Keeping gifts given earlier in the entitlement process.
- Who are the people that will ensure that the vision is implemented/maintained? How do we ensure that the vision is implemented/maintained?
- How do we get enforcement on existing standards? What penalties?
- How do we get State & County to work better on this, with facility planning done in Honolulu, etc.?
- How do we encourage development in our rural areas?
- How do we get State DOT alternative road standards down to counties?
- How do you deal with dynamics of conflicting transportation functions – local road function vs. road as throughway?
- How do you reduce liability of State/County for different standards/level of services in rural areas? e.g. emergency services, no guardrails, etc. (barrier to accomplishing rural vision)
- What does it take to get planners more involved in engineering discussion over standards? Codes prohibit rural standards – how do we get there?
- What are steps to achieving all the pieces of the vision? What’s the process to do this?
- What kinds of things can we do to mitigate past mistakes? Like dealing with what is already in place.
- How do you keep camper vans from coming to Maui with the Super Ferry?
- How do you deal with federal government projects?

Notes from Speaker Q&A

Kahului, Maui, May 1

- Political will--what does it take to do (what was done in Montgomery County, MD or Lancaster County, MD)?
 - looked at cost of servicing ag vs. dev. and what they had to lose
 - some Council Members made tough decisions
 - had vision about what wanted to protect
 - built stakeholder coalitions to understand all this and their role in this
- Examples of rural NIMBY?
 - newcomers moving in
 - zoning ordinances established ag as primary land use. All deeds come with restrictions and puts property purchaser on notice that ag use of all kinds are to be expected under the zoning
- GP and zoning provides feasibility for future: w/ag easement, does this remove opportunities for change for future generations? (takes out of realm of future flexibility)
 - yes, choice made by landowner
 - County also responded to this by going back to redeveloping existing areas, this new investment makes urban communities more attractive
 - if ag industry is viable, then farming will keep land protected
- What if you can't make living off land/farming?
 - ag easement has 25-yr. reopener clause – to ask if easement is still serving purpose, provided that no TDRs sold and easement must be purchased back by property owner
- Have you reached 25-yr. point?
 - yes, several easements are there
 - one still making money, so will stay in farming (horticulture)
- Are golf courses in ag zone?
 - no new golf courses in ag reserve - capped at existing number
- Does landowner keep TDR right on TDR sold?
 - TDR transfer needs to be in deed
- Does TDR reduce estate tax exposure?
 - if you take the development right away, then appraisal should reflect some value less than fair market value
- Need to know how to track TDR - (ordinances needed). Isn't it easier to just purchase development right/easement outright?
 - Montgomery County has a tracking system for TDR
 - TDR assigned serial number
 - Deed of transfer includes TDR serial number
 - TDR serial number included in record plat
 - last, TDR extinguished by County
- TDR/PDR offers permanent protection to land
- Parcels less than 5 acres have no TDR value
- Lancaster County, PA
 - considering TDR for industrial. Could also consider commercial

- Large landowners - transferring between own parcels - can this be done quickly? What am I getting when I get a TDR?
 - getting ability to do additional development on top of what is allowed
 - can transfer density to one portion of property if it's a receiving area
 - plan determines receiving area
 - 2:1 receiving areas : sending area (good rule of thumb)
 - zoning "dictated" landowner decision to do traditional subdivision
- Use of cluster design? How is this different from example shown?
 - ordinance could have made provisions for cluster, open space, set-aides in perpetuity
- Is Ag separate and distinct from rural?
 - depends on dominant land use in area
 - in northeast US, ag is a subset of rural
- Is TDR created greater than value of land itself?
 - supply and demand determines value of TDR. Developer weighs this value of TDR w/value to project
- Receiving area in Montgomery County already zoned, more infill - how do you handle TDR w/new town?
 - receiving area goes thru local master plan process (public process), so public weighs in on what the receiving area will be like
 - in St. Lucie County, FL, they identified areas for a new town and are using form-based zoning code to provide guidance to developers on how the town should develop
 - code includes scale, height, reference to streetscape
- We're all trying to figure out whether these examples will work here in Maui. Also have international market, and complicated entitlement process everyone wants to avoid. Ag subdivision--easiest process--ministerial, no public process for review; infrastructure can be private, no impact fees for needed services
 - Have a similar problem with some subdivisions in Massachusetts where approval is not required--so have to provide incentives to developers
- TDR is attempt to balance developer's needs with public interest/policy/plan. Is there a mechanism like conditional zoning to be able to balance what developer would give in return for project approval?
 - St. Lucie County TDR program: for each TDR of affordable or workforce housing, the developer gets 1.5 additional units
- Can we exercise TDR for public lands?