

Marine and Coastal Zone Advocacy Council (MACZAC) / Ke Kahu O Na Kumu Wai

DRAFT MINUTES

Friday, August 4, 2017: 9:30 am – 11:30 am
Planning Conference Room
250 South High Street, Ground Floor, Wailuku, Hawai‘i 96793

ATTENDANCE

- Members Present: Donna Brown, Sue Sakai, Rich Brunner, Dawn Hegger-Nordblom, Kimbal Thompson, Robert Nishimoto, Angela Anderson
- Members Absent: Phil Fernandez, Jim Coon, Nick Palumbo
- Office of Planning/Coastal Zone Management (OP/CZM) Staff Present: Justine Nihipali, Melanie Lander, Lisa Webster
- Others Present: Jim Buika (Maui County Department of Planning), Keith Scott (Maui County Department of Planning), Tiare Lawrence (HAPA, Malama Olowalu), Thorne Abbott (Coastal Planners, LLC), Albert Perez (Maui Tomorrow Foundation), Stephanie Bennett (NOAA), Tara Owens (UH Sea Grant), Dan McNulty-Huffman (Maui County Department of Planning), Kim Willenbrink (Maui County Department of Planning), Jeff Dack (Maui County Department of Planning), Karen Seebart (Makai Watch), John Seebart (Kahana Bay, WMTA), Mark Deakos (HAMER), Annalise Kehler (Maui County Department of Planning), Daniel Ornellas (DLNR Land Division), Jaclyn Santos (Malama Olowalu), Kai Nishiki (Malama Olowalu)

DISTRIBUTED MATERIAL

- MACZAC Meeting Agenda for August 4, 2017
- Minutes from April 7, 2017 MACZAC Meeting [Draft]
- CZM Program Report to MACZAC (August 4, 2017)
- MACZAC Hotspots 8/2017
- Articles:
 - “Trilogy Outfits All Boats with Reef Safe Sunscreen” –
[<https://mauiNOW.com/2017/07/17/trilogy-outfits-all-boats-with-reef-safe-sunscreen/>]
 - “Feds taking more comments on Trump marine monuments review” –
[http://thegardenisland.com/news/state-and-regional/feds-taking-more-comments-on-trump-marine-monuments-review/article_d9b53731-cfe1-5d40-9b64-4c9dc4d0bf1b.html]
 - “NOAA grants more than \$3M to Hawaii's coastal management programs” –
[<http://www.hawaiinewsnow.com/story/35902869/noaa-grants-more-than-3m-to-hawaiis-coastal-management-programs>]
 - “UH to develop alert system for West Maui flooding” –
[<http://www.staradvertiser.com/2017/07/18/breaking-news/uh-to-develop-alert-system-for-west-maui-flooding/>]

I. Call to Order

MACZAC Chair, Kimbal Thompson, called the meeting to order at 10:02 am and welcomed everyone. Everyone in the room introduced themselves.

II. Approval of April 7, 2017 Meeting Minutes

The April 7, 2017 Meeting Minutes were unanimously approved by all members present.

III. **Hawai'i Coastal Zone Management (CZM) Program Report**

Justine Nihipali, CZM Manager, went over the CZM Program Report highlighting the following:

National Initiatives

National CZM Program Funding

For FY 2017 (July 2017 – June 2018), the CZM Program is at overall level funding from FY 2016. The CZM Grants for CZMA Sections 306/306A (Program) and 309 (Project) total to about \$69.5 million nationally. For the FY 2018 budget, the U.S. Senate Appropriations Committee released the full Commerce, Justice, and Science appropriations report, which includes funding for Coastal Zone Management grants level with FY2017 funding at \$70 Million. The Regional Coastal Resilience Grants are funded at \$15 million and remain under the Coastal Management Grants line item.

Ms. Nihipali suggested that MACZAC might want to write a letter of appreciation acknowledging the support of our congressional representatives.

Hawai'i CZM Program

The following is a status summary of the Hawai'i CZM Program and its initiatives as of date:

- 10 of 11 (2 are 0.5 FTE) positions staffed (1/2 time Project Analyst)
- 1 contractor (via RCUH) for MACZAC.
- 2 student help positions, 1 intern position (to be recruited)
- CZM Website updated periodically (<http://planning.hawaii.gov/czm/>). Working on improving communications for consistency and timeliness.

Section 312 Evaluation

- The Hawai'i CZM Program will undergo a Section 312 Evaluation towards the end of FY17 or early FY18. CZM will be requesting MACZAC involvement as part of its legislative responsibility to evaluate and advocate for the program.
- CZM Staff Contact is Debra Mendes

Ocean Resources Management Plan (ORMP)

- Implementation underway with 2 Action Teams established (Appropriate Coastal Development/Coastal Hazards, and Coral Reef)
- Appropriate Coastal Development/Coastal Hazards ACT led by OP is exploring the implications and feasibility of managed retreat. Consultant is SSFM. The project includes a symposium (slated for January 2018) and a final report due June 2018
- Updated ORMP available on-line at (http://files.hawaii.gov/dbedt/op/czm/ormp/ormp_update_reports/final_ormp_2013.pdf)
- CZM Staff contact is Melanie Lander

Community Stewardship Directory

- 2015 Community Stewardship Directory to be updated w/assistance from student help
- CZM Staff contact is Melanie Lander

Coastal Non-Point Pollution Control Program (CNPCP)

- Three remaining Management Measures require approval by NOAA/EPA:
 1. Roads/Bridges/Highways
 2. On-Site Disposal Systems (OSDS)
 3. BMP Monitoring

- Working with DOT, DOH, Counties (planning departments, public works departments) on completing the above Management Measures
- Information on the CNPCP can be found on-line at (<http://planning.hawaii.gov/czm/initiatives/coastal-nonpoint-pollution-control-program/>)
- CZM Staff contact is Rebecka Arbin

National Estuarine Research Reserve in Hawai‘i

- Designation Ceremony scheduled for August 26, 2017
- Latest information on NERRS Designation Process can be found on-line at (<http://planning.hawaii.gov/czm/initiatives/nerrs-site-proposal-process/>). Incorporates latest outreach in form of story mapping
- Will no longer be reporting as UH-HIMB is the lead agency for implementation
- CZM Staff contact is Rebecka Arbin

Climate Change Adaptation

- One of the ORMP Management Priorities
- Current focus is on the finalization of Act 83 (2014) – Inter-agency Climate Adaptation Committee (ICAC); DLNR and OP are co-chairs of the ICAC
- ICAC projected to have a draft report for Committee review this fall, to be finalized by December 2017 when it is due to legislature
- Information on Climate Change Adaptation can be found on-line at (<http://planning.hawaii.gov/czm/initiatives/adapting-to-climate-change-2/>)
- Act 32, SLH 2017 changes the ICAC to the Climate Mitigation and Adaptation Commission
- Interim CZM Staff contact is Rebecka Arbin

Coastal Hazards

- Continue with training of architects/engineers/planners on code requirements for specific coastal hazards
- Continue to partner with State and County Emergency Management Agencies; State Energy Office, and the private sector on coastal hazards, with tie-in to CZM efforts on climate change adaptation
- Information on Coastal Hazards can be found on-line at (<http://planning.hawaii.gov/czm/initiatives/coastal-hazards/>)
- CZM Staff contact is Sandy Ma

CRest Project

- OP-CZM Program received funding from the Coastal Resilience Networks Grant Program to examine existing county building codes and how such codes may incorporate climate change adaptation measures
- Primarily working with the City and County of Honolulu, Department of Planning and Permitting on the project
- Project will run, and final report to be published, no later than December 31, 2017
- CZM Staff contact is Sandy Ma

Other Initiatives

- CZM Program is involved with a number of external groups and activities:
 - Coral Reef Initiative Working Group (DLNR-DAR)
 - Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council
 - Hokulea’s World Wide Voyage (Castle Foundation)

- Hawai'i Invasive Species Council (HISC) and HISC Resource Committee
 - State Natural Area Reserve System Commission (NARSC)
 - Aloha+ Challenge
 - Coastal States Organization
- Continue to review environmental assessments/environmental impact statements to ensure CZM objectives, policies, and initiatives are considered

IV. **Guest Presentation: Coastal Erosion and Kahana Bay Update**

Tara Owens, UH Sea Grant Extension Agent, gave a presentation highlighting hotspots on Maui, as well as current projects and initiatives.

South Shore

- Kīhei's Kalama Park – because there has been so much shoreline erosion and armoring in the area, some of the unarmored coastline is having some pretty extreme issues with erosion, leading to temporary sandbag structures.
- South Kīhei Road – across from the Kīhei Youth Center – the road is starting to become undermined. As sand blows into the road closer to the Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary, it is being moved to this area. The hope is that placing the sand in these erosion hotspots will prevent the necessity of shoreline hardening in this area.

Kīhei Pīer

North Shore

- Baldwin Beach – the pavilion is in the high wash of the waves, the shower and some of the foundation were lost last summer. Peak erosion at Baldwin beach usually occurs in late August or September. There is a meeting scheduled with the Department of Parks & Recreation to examine short-term and long-term solutions.

West Side

- Napili Bay – sediment in the water shows evidence of active erosion of the beach and the upper bank. Stones from rock revetment structures have been dislodged by wave activity. This increased erosion is of concern for the structures located in the area.
- Keonenui Bay – in October of 2016, after the El Niño winter brought constant high waves, the entire beach disappeared. The underlying land-based sediments and clays were exposed, leading to sedimentation in the water which made the water look like chocolate milk for several days before the sand recovered.
 - Blowholes have appeared in the area after existing seawalls have been undermined, leading to structural damage and property loss.
 - At the Hester property, also on Keonenui Bay, a retaining wall was placed there in 2015, but it wasn't built to specifications, and it was knocked down by big waves in 2016. The debris is still there, and is difficult to access. A cleanup effort will hopefully begin soon.
- North Kā'anapali/Honokōwai Point – the Kā'anapali Beach Club lost 15 feet of property due to beach deflation, beach erosion, and coastal land erosion during the El Niño winter of 2015. This property is pursuing short term erosion mitigation measures, and they will be required to go through an environmental assessment process to look at long term solutions.
- Kahana Beach – the Royal Kahana installed a sandbag structure last summer after loss of a retaining wall, and the undermining of the pool deck and pool hale. The sandbag structure is meant to be a temporary measure while the long term planning for this region is underway.

Ms. Owens explained that erosion has been a problem for a while throughout the Hawaiian Islands, but is worse on Maui, compared to O'ahu and Kaua'i. Maui has the highest rates of erosion (85% of

Maui's beaches are eroding), and the highest percentage of beach loss. Erosion is generally due to a combination of sea level rise leading to chronic erosion, seasonal waves and storms causing episodic erosion, and human impacts like armoring and historic sand mining, contributing to the problem. The chronic erosion caused by sea level rise has narrowed the beaches so that there's no longer enough beach buffer to mitigate seasonal events, leading to extreme events with critical impacts.

The Interagency Climate Adaptation Committee (ICAC), established by the Legislature in 2014, is tasked with completing the Sea Level Rise (SLR) Report (to be completed December 2017). This report will provide a large amount of data on coastal erosion in Hawai'i. Data will include high resolution maps of SLR, average high wave inundation, and maps showing 1% annual chance of flooding. Data is also being collected through the King Tides Project, which collects photographic evidence of extreme high tides using citizen science.

Act 32, from the 2017 Legislative session, converts ICAC from a committee to a commission. The relevance of this is that it means that ICAC's work doesn't just end with the SLR Report. They will continue on and be able to connect all the dots into the future.

What do we do? The responses vary from doing nothing to armoring the shoreline. Other options include managed retreat (erosion-based setbacks, relocations), adaptation strategies (elevate existing structures, beach nourishment, and dune restoration), and temporary controls (sand pushing, geotextile sandbags). Although sandbags are considered temporary controls, they often end up as permanent structures.

Maui County adopted erosion-based setbacks in 2003, using the following equation: setback (ft) = life of structure (yrs) x rate of erosion (ft/yr) + 25 ft. This equation is currently used to determine the setbacks for new structures in Maui County. The County is considering modifying the formula to include future conditions such as SLR, in addition to current erosion rates.

Coastal dune restoration projects in both North and South Maui have been very successful, with dune walkovers providing protection for the dunes as well as beach access for people with disabilities. Beach restoration projects are being considered for West Maui as well, notably at Kahana Bay. Thousands of cubic yards of sand have been found offshore that could be used in West Maui beach restoration projects, but offshore groins would be required to retain sand.

Jim Buika, Maui County Shoreline Planner, stated that there needs to be a shift from reactive to proactive shoreline planning, and shift from the single property approach to the single beach-cell approach, and promote adaptation rather than shoreline hardening. Shoreline permits are complex and challenging to obtain, often involving county, State, and Federal agencies. Mr. Buika added that there needs to be a shift to an e-permit system to expedite and simplify the process, and also make it less costly. Mr. Buika would also like to see the EIS process handled by Master's and PhD students at UH, to lower costs and provide students with thesis projects.

V. **Guest Presentation: Honoapi'ilani Highway Realignment**

Tiare Lawrence, of Malama Olowalu, provided a short presentation promoting realignment of Honoapi'ilani Highway. Ms. Lawrence noted the following:

- The realignment route being considered by Malama Olowalu is not inundated with development, and so there is room to move the highway.
- Malama Olowalu recently helped organize a protest to stop a shoreline hardening project [Department of Transportation (DOT)]. Ms. Lawrence indicated the perception that DOT is using Emergency Proclamations to justify shoreline hardening projects.

- There is often traffic on the highway, which can lead to 2-hour commute times from Central Maui to Lāhainā.
- During recent King Tide events, a monk seal was seen resting on the highway.
- Should the highway be compromised, the people of West Maui will be completely isolated, leading to increased vulnerability. The only hospital on Maui is in Wailuku, which would be inaccessible by road.
- Shoreline hardening in the area is negatively affecting the reef, which will negatively impact the tourist economy in the area. Maui snorkeling industry generates 67 million dollars annually and provides approximately 1,000 jobs.
- There are a number of cultural sites in the area, including burial sites and heiau. By using the existing cane haul road, the realignment could avoid extensive delays for cultural impact studies.
- The Maui Tomorrow Foundation, along with three individual Maui residents: Ms. Lawrence, Archie Kalepa, and Frank Caprioni, filed an injunction calling for the DOT to properly assess the cumulative impacts of building a series of boulder revetments and sea walls in Olowalu.
- Ford Fuchigami, Director of DOT, met with Ms. Lawrence and looked at the most vulnerable areas of Honoapi‘ilani Highway. Ms. Lawrence stated that Mr. Fuchigami explained that DOT doesn’t have the funds to realign the highway, and encouraged Ms. Lawrence to work with legislators to obtain funding from the Legislature for the realignment project.
- By proposing restriping of existing roads, and moving traffic away from the water, Malama Olowalu was able to buy some time to prevent future sea wall development and promote Honoapi‘ilani Highway realignment.

Albert Perez, of Maui Tomorrow, added that sea walls cost a lot of money and require constant repair. Some of the newer walls are already cracked and worn down to exposed rebar. There is salt damage to cars that use the highway. Recreational opportunities are lost along with loss of the beaches, subsistence fishing becomes more difficult, and scenic and open space resources are lost. All of West Maui is federally designated monk seal habitat, one of the bases for the recent law suit. Mr. Perez noted that the realignment project should take into account the expected life of the new road, and then place the road in a location where it will not be affected by erosion or sea level rise. If the project is too expensive to do all at once, small segments of the realignment could be done, one at a time, perhaps as detours. The objective is to change the DOT go-to solution from shoreline hardening to realignment.

Chair Thompson offered to write a letter of support for Honoapi‘ilani Highway realignment with courtesy copies to Governor Ige, Department of Transportation, Hawai‘i Tourism Authority, State Senator Rosalyn Baker, State Representative Angus McKelvey, and Maui County Council Member Elle Cochran.

VI. Public Input

John Seebart noted that the new seawalls along Honoapi‘ilani Highway are already failing, which makes him wonder what DOT is thinking. Mark Deakos stated that in the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands, beaches are retained because erosion is allowed to happen naturally. Because we have infrastructure near the coast, we try to protect the property by hardening the shoreline, which leads to destruction of natural habitat. Dr. Deakos added that it is a difficult situation when there are condos near the shoreline, but in the case of the highway the solution is clear - move the road back to save the natural habitat in the area.

Maui County Planning Department is coordinating a public meeting on September 12, 2017 from 5:30 – 7:30 pm, to be held on the West side of Maui to discuss West Maui Community Plan Update, with a focus on transportation issues. Location to be determined.

Kai Nishiki shared that she lives in Lāhainā, and spends a lot of time at Kahana Bay. She does not want to see groins installed offshore, as she believes they will detract from the beauty of the area. She would rather see the condos removed. She also shared that there is very little public access to the shoreline on the West Side of Maui.

VII. Discussion Highlighting Critical Marine and Coastal Hotspot Issues, By Island

- Maui hotspots:
 - Makila Kai Proposed Development in Launiupoko
Donna Brown, MACZAC member, shared that the proposed development is across from one of the few beaches left for West Maui residents, and the development will likely lead to runoff that will kill the reef.
 - Illegal Commercial Activity on Kanaio Coast
Ms. Brown also received an email regarding illegal commercial activity in the form of horse-back rides, being offered by Tiple L Ranch, and falsely described to a DLNR enforcement officer as ‘agricultural tours’.

VIII. Reports from MACZAC Working Groups

- Legislative Working Group
No report.
- Executive Working Group
A motion was made by MACZAC Vice-Chair Angela Anderson, seconded by MACZAC member Rich Brunner, and unanimously agreed upon by the group to have the Executive Working Group write a letter of thanks to Senator Brian Schatz for his assistance in retaining funding for the CZM program.
- Retreat Working Group
No report.

IX. New Business

- The next MACZAC Quarterly Meeting will be held Friday, November 3, 2017.
- Agenda items for next meeting:
 - Invite DOT to next MACZAC meeting to receive an update on what they are doing regarding Honoapi‘ilani Highway, and what their funding situation looks like.
 - Invite Department of Land and Natural Resources/Office of Conservation and Coastal Lands to come to next meeting to discuss Honoapi‘ilani Highway.
 - Invite a Honolulu County planner to discuss O‘ahu hotspots.
 - Discuss Legislative Working Group plan for 2018 Legislative Session.

X. Adjournment

Chair Thompson adjourned the meeting at 12:15 pm.