BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

OF THE STATE OF HAWAII

In the Matter of the Application of U.S. TELECOM LONG DISTANCE, INC. For a Certificate of Authority.	)	DOCKET NO. 2008-0288

PROTECTIVE ORDER

RECEIVED
2009 MAY 27 A 9:32
DIV. OF CONSUMER ADVOCACY
DEPT. OF COMMERCE AND
CONSUMER AFFAIRS
STATE OF HAWAII

FILED
2009 MAY 26 P 12:08
PUBLIC UTILITIES
COMMISSION

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

OF THE STATE OF HAWAII

In the Matter of the Application of U.S. TELECOM LONG DISTANCE, INC. For a Certificate of Authority.	)	Docket No. 2008-0288

PROTECTIVE ORDER

By this Order, the commission rejects the proposed Stipulation for Protective Order submitted by the parties on November 17, 2008, and issues this Protective Order to govern this proceeding.

I.

Background

On November 17, 2008, U.S. TELECOM LONG DISTANCE, INC. ("Applicant") filed an application ("Application") seeking a certificate of authority to provide resold interexchange telecommunications services throughout the State of Hawaii pursuant to Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR") Chapters 6-61 and 6-80. Applicant served copies of the Application on the DIVISION OF CONSUMER ADVOCACY, DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE AND CONSUMER AFFAIRS ("Consumer Advocate"), an ex officio party to all proceedings before the commission.[1]

[1] See Hawaii Revised Statutes ("HRS") § 269-51; HAR § 6-61-62. Applicant and the Consumer Advocate are hereafter collectively referred to as the "Parties."

In support of its Application, Applicant included various required exhibits, including financial statements as required under HAR § 6-80-17(c)(1)(E) ("Financial Statements"). Applicant requested that the commission treat its Financial Statements as confidential; however, no approved protective order was in place at that time. On November 17, 2008, Applicant and the Consumer Advocate submitted a proposed Stipulation for Protective Order for the commission's review and approval.[2]

Upon review, the commission finds that the proposed stipulation does not fully conform to the commission's requirements and that <u>various</u> revisions are necessary. Given that the Application was filed on November 17, 2008 (approximately six months ago), the commission, for the purpose of securing a "just, speedy, and inexpensive determination" of this proceeding as set forth in HAR § 6-61-1, rejects the Stipulation for Protective Order submitted by the Parties and issues this protective order, the provisions of which are delineated in the section below.

II.

Terms of the Order

1. This protective order governs the classification, acquisition, and use of trade secrets and other confidential information produced by any party in this docket.

---

[2]On December 4, 2008, the Consumer Advocate filed its Statement of Position with respect to Applicant's request.

2. All parties or participants to all or any portion of this docket, including persons who are granted intervention or participation after the effective date of this protective order, shall be subject to this protective order and shall be entitled to all confidential information of a party or participant under the provisions of this protective order to the extent allowed by the commission.

Application of the Uniform Information Practices Act

3. To the extent that any of the documents covered by this protective order consist of "government records," as defined in HRS § 92F-3, the provisions of HRS Chapter 92F, the Uniform Information Practices Act ("UIPA"), shall apply to the disclosure of information contained in such documents. In the event any provision of this protective order conflicts with any provision of the UIPA, the UIPA shall control.

Classification

4. A party to this proceeding may designate as confidential any information it believes, in good faith, contains trade secrets or other confidential research, development, commercial, financial, vendor, or bid information, including but not limited to cost support studies. Such information shall be protected against disclosure to a non-qualified person pursuant to the terms of this protective order, unless such information is declassified, or permission to disclose the information to such non-qualified person is granted by the party claiming confidentiality, as provided in paragraph 13 below.

5. If a party designates information as confidential pursuant to paragraphs 4 above or 6 below, it shall produce the confidential information in accordance with the procedures described in paragraphs 11 through 14 below, and concurrently provide certain information in writing to the commission and the Consumer Advocate. If a party seeks to designate information as confidential, it must: (1) identify, in reasonable detail, the information's source, character, and location, (2) state clearly the basis for the claim of confidentiality, and (3) describe, with particularity, the cognizable harm to the producing party from any misuse or unpermitted disclosure of the information. If the commission or any party challenges the claim of confidentiality of the information, the party claiming confidentiality shall bear the burden of proof in supporting its claim of confidentiality, and the commission will determine whether: (1) the information is confidential and subject to protection under this protective order, or (2) the challenged information must be disclosed by the producing party. Any challenge to the confidentiality of any information shall be made in accordance with paragraph 24 below.

6. Confidential information provided to the commission or a party, orally or in any other form, shall be protected as fully as confidential information provided in written form. A party shall notify the commission and the other parties when information provided orally or in other than written form includes confidential information. At the time of such notification, the party shall, in the manner provided in

paragraph 5 above, specify the subject-matter of such confidential information, the basis for the claim of confidentiality, and the cognizable harm to the producing Party from any misuse or unpermitted disclosure of the information.

Forms of Confidential Information

7. All information claimed to be confidential information shall be subject to the terms of this protective order, and shall be treated by all qualified persons (as defined by this protective order) as constituting confidential information. Unless a different treatment is warranted, any notes, summaries, abstracts, or analyses that are prepared by counsel, experts, or other qualified persons, and that reflects the underlying confidential information, shall also be subject to the terms of this protective order.

Designation

8. A party claiming that information is confidential shall place upon the applicable material the following legend:

CONFIDENTIAL
SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER

Whenever only a portion of a document, transcript, or other material is deemed to contain confidential information, the party shall, to the extent reasonably practicable, limit the claim of confidentiality to only such portion. However, if such limitation is not reasonably practicable, the entire document, transcript, or other material may be designated as confidential information. Notwithstanding the above, Applicant has already in the course of the proceeding provided information that it has identified as confidential. The previously submitted

confidential information includes Applicant's Financial Statements submitted as Exhibit 4 to its Application. Subject to challenge pursuant to paragraph 24, this information shall be governed by and protected under this Protective Order.

9. With respect to any confidential information that is not under the control of the party claiming the information is confidential, other persons shall, to the extent requested by that party, cooperate to ensure that all copies of such confidential information bear the legend required in paragraph 8 above.

10. Any party may request the commission to designate as confidential information any document or other information previously produced but not designated as confidential, provided that the party, in the manner provided in paragraph 5 above, specifies the subject-matter of such confidential information, the basis for the claim of confidentiality, and the cognizable harm to the producing party from any misuse or unpermitted disclosure of the information. In addition, the party claiming confidentiality shall substitute the previously-produced but not designated as confidential material with the identical material under designation as required in Paragraph 8 above.

Disclosure

11. Except as provided in paragraph 13, confidential information shall not be made available or disclosed to any person who is not a "qualified person" as defined in paragraph 12 below.

12. "Qualified person," as used in this protective order means any one of the following:

a. The author(s), addressee(s), or originator(s) of the confidential information;

b. The commission, its staff, counsel (including employees directly employed by such counsel), and any consultants retained by the commission in this proceeding;

c. The Consumer Advocate, its staff, counsel (including employees directly employed by such counsel), and any consultants retained by the Consumer Advocate in this proceeding;

d. Applicant, its officers and employees, its counsel (including employees directly employed by such counsel) and any consultants retained by Applicant;

e. Any other party or participant to this proceeding, its staff, its counsel (including employees directly employed by such counsel), and any consultants retained by it for this proceeding, to the extent allowed by the commission;

f. Any other person approved by the party asserting the claim of confidentiality; and

g. Any other person designated as a qualified person by order of the commission.

13. When a qualified person wishes to disclose confidential information to a non-qualified person, the qualified person must request permission from the party claiming confidentiality. The request shall identify the non-qualified person to whom disclosure is desired; disclose any past, present, or anticipated affiliation between the qualified person and the non-qualified person; specify the exact information to be disclosed; and state the reasons for disclosure. If permission is granted by the party claiming confidentiality, disclosure of the confidential information shall be made to such non-qualified person in the same manner as provided for qualified persons in paragraph 14 below.

Procedure for Obtaining Access

14. Prior to disclosing confidential information to a qualified person other than the commission and its staff and counsel, and the Consumer Advocate, its staff, and counsel, the qualified person shall read a copy of this protective order, complete a copy of the agreement attached as "Exhibit A" to this protective order, and sign the completed copy of the agreement. A copy of the executed agreement shall be delivered to the party claiming confidentiality and the commission.

Use of Confidential Information

15. Any confidential information obtained under this protective order shall be used solely in connection with this proceeding and any related administrative and judicial

proceedings (at which time the information will continue to be treated as confidential), and shall not be used for any other purpose, including business, governmental or commercial purposes, or in any other administrative or judicial proceeding, except as provided in paragraphs 16 and 17, and except as may be directed by (a) an order of court, (b) an order of the commission, and (c) the UIPA, including any ruling of the Office of Information Practices.

16. Any confidential information obtained under this protective order may be used by the commission, its staff and counsel (including employees directly employed by such counsel) in any proceeding pending before the commission involving the producing party, or where the intended use of such confidential information is for the purpose of assisting the commission in fulfilling its statutory duties and responsibilities. The confidential information shall continue to be treated as confidential until the protection conferred by this protective order (or any other applicable protective order) is terminated by the producing party, or until further order of the commission.

17. Any confidential information obtained under this protective order may be used by the Consumer Advocate, its staff, its consultant and its counsel in any proceeding pending before the commission involving the producing party, or where the intended use of such confidential information is for the purpose of assisting the Consumer Advocate in fulfilling its statutory duties and responsibilities. The confidential information shall continue to be treated as confidential until the protection

conferred by this protective order (or any other applicable protective order) is terminated by the producing party, or until further order of the commission.

18. Unless otherwise ordered by the commission, if a party desires to file written testimony, exhibits, or pleadings that contain or reflect the confidential information, only that part of the page(s) containing or reflecting such information shall be treated as confidential, and that part of any hearing at which such information is discussed shall be held in camera, or under other conditions imposed by the commission to prevent unnecessary public disclosure of such information. A copy of any confidential page, with any such information deleted, shall be included in the public record, and each such page shall contain the following designation in the upper left-hand corner:

Confidential Information
Deleted Pursuant To
Protective Order, Filed
On _____.

Retention of Confidential Information

19. Confidential information shall be retained in a locked cabinet dedicated to the storage of confidential information, or otherwise secured to ensure that access to and disclosure of the confidential information is limited to a qualified person.

20. Confidential information that is given to or filed with the commission or its staff and counsel shall be separately bound and placed in a sealed envelope or other appropriate sealed container on which shall appear the following legend:

THIS ENVELOPE IS SEALED PURSUANT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER, FILED ON _____ AND CONTAINS DOCUMENTS WITH CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION. IT IS NOT TO BE OPENED OR THE CONTENTS OF THIS ENVELOPE DISPLAYED OR REVEALED EXCEPT TO QUALIFIED PERSONS AUTHORIZED TO INSPECT THE ENCLOSED DOCUMENTS.

21. Confidential information shall not be reproduced or duplicated, except to make working copies and copies to be filed with the commission under seal. If a document contains information so sensitive that it should not be copied by anyone, it shall bear the following legend: "Copying Prohibited."

22. If a court or other administrative agency requests, subpoenas, or orders production of confidential information that a party or person has obtained under this protective order, that party or person, prior to disclosure, shall promptly notify the party claiming confidentiality of the request, subpoena, or order.

Duration of Confidentiality

23. The confidentiality of the information produced pursuant to this protective order shall be preserved until all interested parties, by written stipulation, terminate the protection conferred by this protective order, or until further order of the commission.

Appeal to the Commission

24. If any interested person disagrees with the designation of information as confidential, the party claiming confidentiality and the person so disagreeing shall first make a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute on an informal basis. If the dispute cannot be resolved, the person contesting the

confidentiality of the information shall file a motion to compel disclosure or any other appropriate motion with the commission. The party claiming confidentiality shall bear the burden of proof in supporting its claim, and the commission will determine whether the information shall continue to be designated as confidential under this protective order. Pending a disposition of the motion, the information in question shall be treated as confidential information and shall not be disclosed except as permitted in this protective order.

Non-Waiver of Objections and Rights

25. The parties retain the right to contest any assertion or finding of confidentiality or of non-confidentiality.

26. The parties retain the right to question, challenge, and object to the admissibility of confidential information on the grounds of relevancy or materiality.

Modification of the Protective Order

27. The commission may modify this protective order on the motion of any party, or on its own motion, upon reasonable notice to the parties and an opportunity for hearing, or the commission may modify this protective order upon receipt and approval of a written stipulation by the parties.

Disposal of Confidential Information

28. Except as provided in paragraphs 29 and 30 below, within ninety days after the conclusion of this proceeding, persons in possession of confidential information shall, at the option of the party producing the confidential information,

return or destroy all such materials and all copies, notes, tapes, papers, or other medium containing, summarizing, excerpting, or otherwise embodying any confidential information. If the party producing the confidential information requests destruction, the person destroying the information shall certify its destruction to the producing party, indicating the name of the person destroying the documents, the method of destruction, and the identity of the specific documents destroyed.

29. Counsel and representatives of record for a party shall be entitled to retain memoranda, pleadings, exhibits of record, written testimony, and transcripts embodying information derived from or incorporating confidential information to the extent reasonably necessary to preserve files on this proceeding. The files shall not be disclosed to any other person.

30. Confidential information produced in this proceeding shall remain in the possession of the commission, the Consumer Advocate and counsel for the Consumer Advocate for the duration required by applicable statutes, rules and administrative directives.

Sanctions

31. Any person violating this protective order shall be subject to sanctions imposed by the commission.

III.

Orders

THE COMMISSION ORDERS:

1. The proposed Stipulation for Protective Order submitted by the Parties on November 17, 2008, is rejected.

2. The terms and provisions set forth in section II of this Protective Order shall govern the classification, acquisition, and use of trade secrets and other confidential information produced in this docket by the Parties.

DONE at Honolulu, Hawaii MAY 2 6 2009.

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF HAWAII

By _____
Carlito P. Caliboso, Chairman

By _____
John E. Cole, Commissioner

By _____
Leslie H. Kondo, Commissioner

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

_____
Ji Sook Kim
Commission Counsel

2008-0288.cp

EXHIBIT A

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF HAWAII

PROTECTIVE AGREEMENT

1. I, _____, have been presented with a copy of the Protective Order issued by the Hawaii Public Utilities Commission in Docket No. _____ on the _____ day of _____, 2009 ("Protective Order"").

2. I am employed, retained or assisting _____ in Docket No. _____ and have requested review of the confidential information covered by the Protective Order.

3. I understand the confidential information covered by the Protective Order is to be used solely to assist _____ and that unless otherwise permitted by the Protective Order, I am to make no other use of the confidential information, nor am I to disclose the confidential information to any other person.

4. I further understand that at the conclusion of my assistance to _____, I shall account for each copy, extract, note and summary of, or other document containing any part of such confidential information to the party claiming confidentiality and I shall abide by the provisions in paragraph 28 of the Protective Order, unless otherwise permitted by paragraphs 29 and 30 of the Protective Order.

5. I hereby certify that I have read the above-mentioned Protective Order and agree to abide by its terms and conditions.

DATED at: _____, _____, this _____, _____.
(city) (state) (date)

_____
Signature

_____
_____
_____
Address

(____)_____
Telephone Number

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The foregoing order was served on the date of filing by mail, postage prepaid, and properly addressed to the following parties:

CATHERINE P. AWAKUNI
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE AND CONSUMER AFFAIRS
DIVISION OF CONSUMER ADVOCACY
P. O. Box 541
Honolulu, HI 96809

ROBERT YOUNG
PRESIDENT
U.S. TELECOM LONG DISTANCE, INC.
3960 Howard Hughes Parkway, 5th Floor
#5001F
Las Vegas, NV 89109

ANDREW ISAR
PRESIDENT
MILLER ISAR, INC.
7901 Skansie Avenue, Suite 240
Gig Harbor, WA 98335

Regulatory Consultant for U.S. TELECOM LONG DISTANCE, INC.