REAL ESTATE APPRAISER ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Professional and Vocational Licensing Division Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs State of Hawaii

MINUTES OF MEETING

The agenda for this meeting was filed with the Office of the Lieutenant Governor, as required by Section 92-7(b), Hawaii

Revised Statutes.

<u>Date</u>: Wednesday, August 7, 2013

<u>Time</u>: 10:00 a.m.

<u>Place</u>: King Kalakaua Conference Room

King Kalakaua Building

335 Merchant Street, 1st Floor

Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Present: Paul Cool, Industry Member, Chairperson

George Leong, Financial Institution Member

Richard Stellmacher, Industry Member Brian J. Walther, Industry Member

Patrick Yamada, Financial Institution Member

Alan Taniguchi, Executive Officer

Lori Nishimura, Secretary

Excused: James Wong, Public Member

James Paige, Deputy Attorney General

Guests: Kristi Klamet, Policy Manager, Appraisal Subcommittee ("ASC")

Jenny Tidwell, Policy Manager, ASC

Call to Order: There being a quorum present, the meeting was called to order at

10:00 a.m. by Chairperson Cool.

Additions/

Revisions to the

Agenda: None.

Welcome and Introduction of

New Members: Chairperson Cool welcomed and introduced two new members, George Leong and George Leong and Brian J. Walther to the Committee. He thanked Brian J. Walther:

them for volunteering their time to serve in this Committee.

Election of Vice-Chairperson:

Chairperson Cool stated an election to formalize the position of Vice-Chairperson would be needed, and requested for nominations. Chairperson Cool nominated Mr. Stellmacher for the position of Vice-Chairperson; there were no other nominations. It was moved by Mr. Yamada, seconded by Mr. Leong, and unanimously carried to elect Mr. Stellmacher as the Committee's Vice-Chairperson.

Approval of the June 27, 2013 Meeting Minutes: After discussion, it was moved by Vice-Chairperson Stellmacher, seconded by Chairperson Cool, and unanimously carried to approve the minutes of the June 27, 2013 meeting as circulated.

New Business: Review of Applications a.

None.

b. Ratification of Courses

> It was moved by Vice-Chairperson Stellmacher, seconded by Chairperson Cool, and unanimously carried to ratify the approval of the following CAP approved courses:

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

Index #: Course Title & Approved Hours:

Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use -13-027

> **Synchronous** 35 QE/CE w/ exam 32 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: McKissock, LP

Index #: Course Title & Approved Hours:

13-023 General Appraiser Income Approach

> 60 QE/CE w/ exam 55 CE w/o exam

13-026 General Report Writing & Case Studies 30 QE/CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam

It was moved by Vice-Chairperson Stellmacher, seconded by Mr. Walther, and unanimously carried to approve the following non-CAP approved courses, based on the initial review and recommendation by Chairperson Cool:

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

Index #:	Course Title & Approved Hours:
13-028	International Valuation Standards Overview 8 CE w/exam 7 CE w/o exam
13-029	Litigation Assignments for Residential Appraisers 4 CE
13-030	Review Theory - General 33 CE w/exam 30 CE w/o exam
13-031	Review Theory - Residential 17 CE w/exam

<u>Course Provider</u>: <u>Hawaii Chapter of the Appraisal</u> <u>Institute</u>

Index #:	Course Title & Approved Hours
13-024	State of the Profession Part 1 3.5 CE
13-025	State of the Profession Part 2 3.5 CE

15 CE w/o exam

<u>Unfinished</u> Business: Discussion ensued on the vacant public member seat that has not yet been filled. Chairperson Cool informed members to forward any recommendations, which may include a resume and letter of interest, to Executive Officer Taniguchi. Recommendation(s) will

then be forward to the Director of the Department, who has the power and authority to appoint members to the Committee.

Appraisal Subcommittee:

Kristi Klamet and Jenny Tidwell, Policy Managers from ASC were introduced and welcomed by the Committee. Ms. Klamet gave a brief history/description of ASC which oversees the appraisal regulatory programs established by States. She informed the Committee that the establishment of the Appraisal Complaint National Hotline (who refers complainants to the appropriate State or Federal agencies) went live in March. Ms. Klamet also informed the Committee that an expanded ASC findings and rating criteria system has been implemented.

Ms. Klamet provided the following preliminary findings from this Program's eighth bi-annual field review for compliance with Title XI of the Financial Institutions Reform, Recovery, and Enforcement Act of 1989:

- Statute/Rules: the language in the rules should be amended to include a change to the trainee education as mandated by the 2010 Dodd-Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act ("Dodd-Frank Act"); effective 07/01/2013, completion of seventy-five (75) creditable class hours is required for trainees. Therefore, the State will be suggested to inform current CRAs and CGAs who may have trainees of this education requirement.
- Effective 2015, background checks, fingerprinting will be required of all new applicants and upgrades to existing licenses (this requirement will not be retroactive).
- Temporary License Applications: "all in order".
- National Registry: "all in order".
- Application Process: "all in order" which includes the work product review and reciprocity/endorsement.
- Education: course provider agreements "all good".
- Enforcement: Ms. Klamet stated that complaints received at the Regulated Industries Complaints Office ("RICO") were well documented; sanctions were fair, and complaints were resolved within one year.

Ms. Klamet stated that a preliminary findings "ASC staff report" will be sent to the State, and the State will be given 60 days to respond with a plan to correct/address concerns found from their field review. ASC staff will consider the State's response and make a formal recommendation(s) to ASC for final disposition. ASC will consider the State's response and ultimately issue a final Compliance Review Report and letter to the State with a determination regarding the State's compliance with Title 11.

Discussion ensued on the impeding background check, fingerprinting requirement; Executive Officer Taniguchi informed the Committee that an amendment to the Hawaii Criminal Justice Data Center's statute would be needed to allow us to conduct background checks.

Discussion ensued as to the definition of a trainee; as may be someone who provides significant appraisal assistance.

Ms. Tidwell stated that "there is no clear definition" of a trainee but there is a scope of practice and reference to USPAP.

Correspondence: None.

Announcements: None.

Next Meeting: Wednesday, October 2, 2013

10:00 a.m.

King Kalakaua Conference Room

King Kalakaua Building 335 Merchant Street, 1st Floor Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Adjournment: There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was

adjourned at 10:50 a.m.

Taken and recorded by:

/s/ Lori Nishimura

Lori Nishimura Secretary

Reviewed and approved by:				
/s/ Alan Taniguchi				
Alan Taniguchi Executive Officer				
AT:In				
08/23/13				
[X] Minutes approved as is.[] Minutes approved with changes.	See Minutes of			

Page 6