

DEPARTMENT OF THE CORPORATION COUNSEL 205

PATRICK K. WONG 5878 Corporation Counsel CALEB P. ROWE 9520 KRISTIN K. TARNSTROM 9934 **Deputies Corporation Counsel** County of Maui 200 South High Street Wailuku, Maui, Hawaii 96793 Telephone No.: (808) 270-7741 Facsimile No.: (808) 270-7152 Email: caleb.rowe@co.maui.hi.us Attorneys for COUNTY OF MAUI, DEPARTMENT OF WATER SUPPLY

COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

STATE OF HAWAII

In the Matter of the Contested Case Hearing on the Water Use Permit Application Originally Filed by Kukui (Molokai), Inc., Now Refiled as a New Ground Water Use by Molokai Public Utilities, LLC CASE NO. CCH-MO-97-14

COUNTY OF MAUI, DEPARTMENT OF WATER SUPPLY'S INITIAL BRIEF; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

COUNTY OF MAUI, DEPARTMENT OF WATER SUPPLY'S <u>INITIAL BRIEF</u>

Comes now, County of Maui, Department of Water Supply ("MDWS"), by and through

its attorneys PATRICK K. WONG, Corporation Counsel, and CALEB P. ROWE and KRISTIN

K. TARNSTROM, Deputies Corporation Counsel, and hereby submits its Initial Brief pursuant

to the Minute Order regarding the potential dismissal of the contested case.

I. <u>PROCEDURAL HISTORY</u>

The Commission on Water Resources Management (CWRM) designated the island of Moloka'i as a water management area effecting July 15, 1992. Accordingly, pursuant to Hawaii Revised Statutes ("HRS") § 174C-50(c), existing users of water needed to file water use permits by July 15, 1993, one year following the designation, or they would be presumed to have abandoned their pre-existing use. Petitioner Kukui (Moloka'i), Inc. filed a Ground Water Use Permit Application ("GWUPA") for an existing use on December 15, 1993. On appeal of CWRM's decision to grant Kukui (Moloka'i)'s existing water use permit, the Hawai'i Supreme Court ruled the Kukui (Moloka'i)'s application was untimely pursuant to HRS § 174C-50(c), and vacated CWRM's order granting petitioner's application. See <u>In re Contested Case Hearing on Water Use Permit Application Filed by Kukui (Moloka'i, Inc.</u>, 116 Haw. 481, 501, 174 P.3d 320, 340 (2007). Kukui (Moloka'i)'s successor in interest, Moloka'i Public Utilities ("MPU"), filed a New GWUPA on June 27, 2014.

II. <u>ARGUMENT</u>

The Contested Case Hearing MO-97-14 has been rendered moot by the Supreme Court's 2007 Decision in <u>In re Contested Case Hearing on Water Use Permit Application Filed by Kukui</u> (<u>Molokai</u>), <u>Inc.</u>, 116 Haw. 481, 501. In that case, the Supreme Court found that the petitioner's application for an existing use Ground Water Use Permit was untimely, that any existing use was presumed abandoned pursuant to HRS § 174C-50(c), and that Kukui (Moloka'i) needed to apply for a new use permits under HRS § 174C-51 in order to "revive its expired uses." <u>Id</u>. at 503. Subsequent to this decision, petitioner's successor interest MPU, filed a GWUPA for 1.0265 MGD on June 27, 2014.

Because petitioner's GWUPA was determined to be untimely and Molokai Public Utilities has filed a completely new GWUPA, the Contested Case Hearing on Kukui (Moloka'i)'s 1997 GWUPA has been rendered moot. Quite simply, there are no issues that remain unresolved regarding Kukui (Moloka'i)'s 1993 permit. While new GWUPAs have been submitted by several other parties, those GWUPAs are separate and distinct from the permit at issue in CCH-MO-97-14, and CWRM should treat and process them accordingly. For the sake of administrative efficiency, the County does not object to consolidation of the remaining permits into a new contested case hearing.

III. <u>CONCLUSION</u>

The underlying permit in this case has been rendered moot and effectively abandoned. Accordingly, CWRM should dismiss this Contested Case Hearing and process the recently filed GWUPA's a separate matter under a separate heading and case number.

DATED: Wailuku, Maui, Hawaii, March 24, 2016.

PATRICK K. WONG Corporation Counsel Attorney for COUNTY OF MAUI DEPARTMENT OF WATER SUPPLY

alu BV

CALEB P. ROWE KRISTIN K. TARNSTROM Deputies Corporation Counsel

COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

STATE OF HAWAII

In the Matter of the Contested Case Hearing on the Water Use Permit Application Originally Filed by Kukui (Molokai), Inc., Now Refiled as a New Ground Water Use by Molokai Public Utilities, LLC CASE NO. CCH-MO-97-14

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this date a true and correct copy of the foregoing document

was duly served, via email to the following, with hard copies to follow U.S mail, postage prepaid,

upon the following individuals as follows:

COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT P.O. Box 621 Honolulu, HI 96809 (via email to: Kathy.S.Yoda@hawaii.gov)

(via email to: david.frankel@nhlchi.org)

DAVID FRANKEL, ESQ. DAVID KOPPER, ESQ. Native Hawaiian Legal Corporation 1164 Bishop Street, Suite 1205 Honolulu, HI 96813 Attorneys for Appellants Judy Caprida and Georgina Kuahuia

DAVID SCHULMEISTER, ESQ. 1000 Bishop Street, Suite 1200 Honolulu, HI 96813 Attorney for

Molokai Public Utilities, LLC

(via email to:dschulmeister@cades.com)

ERNIE KIMOTO, ESQ. KOALANI L. KAULUKUKUI, ESQ. Office of Hawaiian Affairs 560 North Nimitz Highway Honolulu, Hawaii 96817 Attorney for Office of Hawaiian Affairs

(via email to: erniek@oha.org)

DIANE TAIRA, ESQ. MATTHEW DVONCH, ESQ. Department of the Attorney General 425 Queen Street Honolulu, Haawaii 96813 Attorney for Department of Hawaiian Homelands (via email to: diane.k.taira@hawaii.gov)

(via email to: linda.l.chow@hawaii.gov)

LINDA L.W. CHOW, ESQ. Deputy Attorney General Department of the Attorney General State of Hawai'i 465 South King Street, Room 300 Honolulu, HI 96813 Attorney for the COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

DATED: Wailuku, Maui, Hawaii, March 24, 2016.

PATRICK K. WONG Corporation Counsel Attorney for COUNTY OF MAUI DEPARTMENT OF WATER SUPPLY

al. BVC

CALEB P. ROWE **KRISTIN K. TARNSTROM Deputies Corporation Counsel**