



**STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT**

**OBJECTION TO AN
APPURTENANT RIGHTS CLAIM**

Form APRT-OBJ
For Official Use Only: WATER RESOURCE PERMIT
2012 SEP 21 PM 1:09

Instructions: Complete one (1) "Objection to an Appurtenant Rights Claim Form" (Form APRT-OBJ) for each Appurtenant rights claim to which you object.

- Any person or entity with a legal or material interest in the water may file written objections. Persons filing objections must serve copies of the written objection and all related documentation / evidence 1) on the applicant; and 2) on the Commission on Water Resource Management, P.O. Box 621, Honolulu, HI 96809.
- Appurtenant rights claimants will have an opportunity to submit a rebuttal to the written objections.
- For questions, contact the Commission's Stream Protection and Management Branch at (808) 587-0234.

A. OBJECTOR		
NAME/COMPANY Wailuku Water Company, LLC		Contact Person Avery B. Chumbley
Mailing Address P. O. Box 2790, Wailuku, Hawaii 96793		
Phone 808/244-7079	Fax 808/242-7968	E-mail Address abc@aloha.net

Explain your legal or material interest in objecting to this Appurtenant rights claim.
Wailuku Water Company, LLC is the owner and operator of the private distribution system through which the Applicant receives surface water. Determination of Applicant's claim of an appurtenant right to water that is distributed through Wailuku Water Company, LLC's distribution system may impact the operation of the distribution system and will affect the property rights of Wailuku Water Company, LLC.

B. APPLICANT (As listed in the Public Notice)		
NAME/COMPANY	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc.	r Use Permit Application No.
Mailing Address	800 Lower Main Street Wailuku, HI 96793 SWUPA# 2318/2319N	
Identify all Tax Map Keys (TMK):	TMK: (2)3-2-007-018	

C. REASON(S) FOR OBJECTION

Select all that apply below. The objector has the burden of proof on all objections.

The parcel was not used as a residence or for cultivation at the time of the Mahele.

The Appurtenant right to water has been reserved or extinguished.

There are materially false statements or representations in the claimant's application for Appurtenant rights.

Summarize carefully your objection and how approval of this Application would adversely affect your legal interests (Use separate page if needed):
The claim must be reviewed in light of the following:
1-Whether the claim properly characterized the source of the water for which the claim is asserted; and,
2-Whether the rights claimed are subject to Public Utilities Commission Regulation;

See the attached sheets which expand on the objections and provide documentary support for the objection(s).

Supporting documentation / evidence must be provided on separate sheets.

D. OBJECTOR SIGNATURE		
<input type="checkbox"/> By checking this box (for electronic submissions) or signing below (for hardcopy submissions) indicates that the signatory understands and swears that the information provided is accurate and true to the best of their knowledge.		
Print Name: Avery B. Chumbley, Authorized Representative	Signature: 	Date: September 18, 2012

DIVER.3650.6

FILE ID:	VWUP.2318/2319
DOC ID:	10036

Whether the Claim Properly Characterized The Source of Water

The claim contains an ambiguity or possibly a mischaracterization on the water source for the appurtenant right.

A claimant to an appurtenant right must establish that the surface water was taken directly from the stream, or from an auwai that was connected to a stream, at the time of the original conversion of the property to fee simple title.

Claims based on surface water taken from a privately owned distribution system and not from a stream, especially a distribution system that did not exist at the time of the original fee simple conversion, does not establish an appurtenant right to surface water delivered through a privately owned distribution system.

Accordingly, factual and legal questions exist on whether the subject claim for appurtenant rights derives from a diversion that existed at the time of the original fee simple conversion from a stream or an auwai that was then connected to a stream.

In addition, factual and legal questions exist as to whether applicant is required to hold a stream diversion works permit and/or a stream channel alteration permit and whether there is a right to use a privately owned distribution system if the surface water is being diverted through that privately owned distribution system.

Rights Claimed May be Subject to Public Utilities Commission Regulation

The claim asserts a right to use surface water that reaches the claimant's property through a distribution system owned by Wailuku Water Company, LLC

The ability of Wailuku Water Company, LLC to deliver water through that distribution system is the subject of a proceeding pending before the State of Hawaii Public Utilities Commission ("PUC").

Any determination by the Commission on Water Resource Management on claims in which the surface water is delivered through use of the distribution system owned by Wailuku Water Company, LLC must include a condition that the delivery of the surface water is subject to applicable terms, conditions, rules, regulations, decisions, orders, tariffs, and actions of the PUC (collectively "PUC Regulation")

Accordingly, factual and legal questions exist on whether the subject claim for appurtenant rights may be subject to PUC Regulation.