

PAUL R. MANCINI\*  
THOMAS D. WELCH, JR.  
JAMES W. GEIGER

—————  
COUNSEL  
ROSALYN LOOMIS  
—————

\*A LAW CORPORATION

**MANCINI, WELCH & GEIGER LLP**  
A LIMITED LIABILITY LAW PARTNERSHIP

THE KAHULUI BUILDING  
33 LONO AVE., SUITE 470  
KAHULUI, HAWAII  
96732-1681

—————  
TELEPHONE:  
(808) 871-8351  
—————

FACSIMILE:  
(808) 871-0732

June 15, 2009

Commission on Water Resource Management  
P.O. Box 621  
Honolulu, HI 96809

Re: **Surface Water Use Permit Applications**  
**Na Wai Eha Surface Water Management Area**  
**File Nos. 2178, 2209, 2211-2213, 2215, 2217, 2219, 2221, 2223-2225, 2227-**  
**2228, 2230-2231, 2233, 2235 - 2241, 2243, 2245, 2247, 2249 - 2250, 2252, 2254,**  
**2256, 2258-2260, 2262, 2264, 2266, 2268 - 2269, 2271, 2273, 2275 - 2278, 2280,**  
**2298, 2305, 2307, 2309, 2311 - 2313, 2315 - 2316, 2318, 2320, 2322, 2324, 2326,**  
**2328, 2330, 2332, 2334, 2336, 2338 and 2342**

Ladies and Gentlemen:

This firm represents Wailuku Water Company, LLC ("Wailuku Water") which is presently before the Commission in a proceeding by which interim in-stream flow standards for the five streams located within the Na Wai Eha Surface Water Management Area ("NWE Surface Water Management Area") are being addressed. While that action was pending, the Commission gave notice that persons who desired permits to allow the use of water from the NWE Surface Water Management Area were to file complete applications for such permits no later than April 30, 2009.

Wailuku Water was one of the applicants for a water use permit from the NWE Surface Water Management Area and identified each of the four hydrologic units as being a source for its application.

Wailuku Water filed exceptions to the proposed Decision and Order establishing amended interim in-stream flow standards ("IIFS") because, among other reasons, the record as it presently exists neither includes information which the Commission is mandated to consider nor includes any reference to consideration of such statutorily mandated information. As such, Wailuku Water objects to the establishment of amended IIFS for the Na Wai Eha streams until such time as all requirements placed upon the Commission have been met.

Wailuku Water believes it unlikely that this Commission will begin the process of approving or rejecting a permit application until it has completed the process required of it to establish the amended IIFSs. However, because H. Admin. R. §13-171-19(a) would allow this

Commission on Water Resource Management

Page 2

June 15, 2009

Commission to act if no statement of objections were made to the permit applications, Wailuku Water is advising the Commission of its objections.

Objections to the above-referenced applications are as noted in the attached chart; the objections are as explained on the attached Appendix. Wailuku Water does not possess complete information about each application and accordingly reserves its right to raise additional objections to the applications as Wailuku Water receives additional information on each application.

Wailuku Water asks that the Commission file these objections with each permit application listed on the attached document. By copy of this letter, notice of the objections is being given to each of the applicants to which Wailuku Water is making objection. If you have any questions about this, please feel free to contact me.

Very truly yours,

**MANCINI, WELCH & GEIGER**



Paul R. Mancini

PRM:jwg/tlc

Enclosures

cc: Wailuku Water Company, LLC (w/ encls.)

## LIST OF APPLICANTS AND ADDRESSES

County of Maui  
Department of Water Supply  
200 South High Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Vernon Bal  
230 Koeli Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Dorothy T. Bell  
1419 Nuna Place  
Waikapu, HI 96793

Douglas Bell  
1420 Honua Place  
Waikapu, HI 96793

Alan Birnie  
175 W. Waiko Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Gary & Evelyn Brito  
2160A Puuohala Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Regino Cabacungan  
304 Hoomalu Place  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Cordell Chang  
2315 Kahekili Highway  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Winifred & Gordon Cockett  
1159 Piihana Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

James Phillip Dodd  
P.O. Box 351  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Michael Doherty  
41 Waihee Valley Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Richard Emoto  
P.O. Box 2748  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Stanley Faustino  
384 Waihee Valley Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Patricia Z. Federcell  
135 Waiko Road  
Waikapu, HI 96793

Diannah K. Goo  
2120 C Kahekili Highway  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Russel Gushi  
185 West Waiko Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Valentine Haleakala  
2160 Puuohala Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Karl & Lee Ann Harders  
1422 Nuna Place  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Theodore & Zelig Harders  
1415 Kilohi Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Darrell Higa  
918 Kanakea Loop  
Lahaina, HI 96761

Hoolulahu LLC  
575 A Iao Valley Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Greg Ibara  
227 Kawaiipuna Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Vanessa J. Ince & WS Kinzer  
484 Kalua Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Jinsei Miyashiro Trust  
P.O. Box 235  
Wailuku, HI 96793

John Minamina Brown Trust  
727 Waihee Street, Suite 104  
Lahaina, HI 96761

Kenneth Kahalekai  
240 Waihee Valley Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Alfred Kailiehu, Jr.  
3660 Kahekili Highway  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Cristal Koki  
P.O. Box 442  
Wailuku, HI 96793

David & Katherine Lengkeek  
128 River Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Kenneth Mendoza  
2160 B Puuohala Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Lawrence Miyahira  
P.O. Box 762  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Elsie Miyamoto  
1418 Honua Place  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Kalani & Tera Paleka  
P.O. Box 342  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Piko Ao, LLC  
2839 Kalialani Circle  
Pukalani, HI 96768

Isabelle Rivera  
P.O. Box 634  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Katherine T. Riyu  
P.O. Box 696  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Michael Rodrigues  
2518 W. Main Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Alex Buttaro  
1299 A Malaihi Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Waldemar & Darlene Rogers  
1421 Nuna Place  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Francisco Cerizo  
P.O. Box 492  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Alfred Santiago  
2445 C Vineyard Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

William Freitas  
2644 Kahekili Highway  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Duke & Jean Sevilla  
Christina Smith  
702 Kaae Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Paul & Jennifer Higashino  
P.O. Box 239  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Ione Shimizu  
219 K West Waiko Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Kauai Kahalekai  
202 Waihee Valley Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Warren K.H. Soong  
245 A West Waiko Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Charlene E. Kana  
P.O. Box 292  
Wailuku, HI 96793

T&Z Harders Family Ltd  
Partnership  
E.H. Rogers  
W.F. Rogers  
1415 Kilohi Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Leinaala M. Kihm  
1415 Honua Place  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Victor & Waillette Pellegrino  
1420 Kilohi Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Thomas & Patricia Texeira  
Denis Texeira  
205 Waihee Valley Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Melvin Riyu  
Judith Yamanoue  
P.O. Box 696  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Noel & Katherine Texeira  
2239 Kahekili Highway  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Burt H. Sakata  
Peter Fritz  
107 Waihee Valley Road  
Wailuku, HI 96793

John Varel  
P.O. Box 1468  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Alfred Santiago  
Colin Kailiponi  
2445 C Vineyard Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

Aloha Poi Factory, Inc.  
800 Lower Main Street  
Wailuku, HI 96793

WRC File	Applicant	Objections
2178	County of Maui, DWS	1, 2, 7, 8 (pub. 4/24 and 5/22)
2209	Vernon Bal	1, 2, 3, 7
2211	Dorothy T. Bell	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2212	Douglas Bell	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2213	Alan Birnie	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2215	Gary & Evelyn Brito	1, 2, 3, 7
2217	John Minamina Brown Trust	1, 2, 3, 7
2219	Regino Cabacungan	1, 2, 7
2221	Cordell Chang	1, 2, 3, 7
2223	Winifred/Gordon Cockett	1, 2, 3, 7
2224	James Phillip Dodd	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2225	Michael Doherty	1, 2, 3, 7
2227	Richard Emoto	1, 2, 3, 7
2228	Stanley Faustino	1, 2, 3, 7
2230	Patricia Z. Federcell	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2231	Diannah K. Goo	1, 2, 3, 7
2233	Diannah K. Goo	1, 2, 3, 7
2235	Russel Gushi	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2236	Valentine Haleakala	1, 2, 3, 7
2237	Karl & Lee Ann Harders	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2238	T&Z Harders Fam Ltd Ptnshp	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2239	Theodore & Zelig Harders	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2240	T&Z Harders Fam Ltd Ptnshp	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2241	Darrell Higa	1, 2, 3, 7
2243	Hooululahu LLC	1, 2, 3, 7
2245	Greg Ibara	1, 2, 3, 7
2247	Vanessa J. Ince & WS Kinzer	1, 2, 3, 7
2249	Kenneth Kahalekai	1, 2, 3, 7
2250	Alfred Kailiehu, Jr.	1, 2, 3, 7
2252	Cristal Koki	1, 2, 3, 7
2254	David & Katherine Lengkeek	1, 2, 4, 7
2256	Kenneth Mendoza	1, 2, 3, 7
2258	Lawrence Miyahira	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2259	Elsie Miyamoto	1, 2, 5, 7
2260	Jensei Miyashiro Trust	1, 2, 3, 7
2262	Kalani & Tera Paleka	1, 2, 3, 7
2264	Piko Ao, LLC	1, 2, 5, 7
2266	Isabelle Rivera	1, 2, 3, 7
2268	Katherine T. Riyu	1, 2, 5, 7
2269	Michael Rodrigues	1, 2, 3, 7
2271	Waldemar & Darlene Rogers	1, 2, 5, 7
2273	Alfred Santiago	1, 2, 3, 7

WRC File	Applicant	Objections
2275	Duke & Jean Sevilla & Christina Smith	1, 2, 4, 7
2276	Ione Shimizu	1, 2, 5, 7
2277	Warren K.H. Soong	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2278	Noel & Katherine Texeira	1, 2, 3, 7
2280	Thomas & Patricia Texeira & Denise Texeira	1, 2, 3, 7
2298	John Varel	1, 2, 4, 6, 7
2305	Alex Buttarro	1, 2, 7
2307	Francis Cerizo	1, 2, 7
2309	William Freitras	1, 2, 3, 7
2311	Theodore & Zelig Harders	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2312	Kauai Kahalekai	1, 2, 3, 7
2313	Charlene E. Kana	1, 2, 3, 7
2315	Leinaala M. Kihm	1, 2, 5, 7
2316	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc. / Apo	1, 2, 3, 7
2318	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc. / Ideoka	1, 2, 3, 7
2320	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc. / Anakalea	1, 2, 3, 7
2322	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc. / Barrett	1, 2, 3, 7
2324	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc. / Laa	1, 2, 3, 7
2326	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc. / Ciacci	1, 2, 3, 7
2328	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc. / Nakama	1, 2, 3, 7
2330	Aloha Poi Factory, Inc. / Lee	1, 2, 3, 7
2332	Vicotor & Walette Pellegrino	1, 2, 3, 5, 7
2334	Burt H. Sakata & Peter Fritz	1, 2, 3, 7
2336	Alfred Santiago & Colin Kaliponi	1, 2, 3, 7
2338	Melvin Riyu & Judith Yamanoue	1, 2, 3, 7
2342	Paul & Jennifer Higashino	1, 2, 7

**Appendix I**  
**Objections to SWUPA**

1. **Premature to Process SWUPA due to lack of adoption of amended IIFS.**

The rules adopted by the Commission on Water Resource Management (the "Commission") concerning the permit application process are found in H.Admin.R. §§ 13-171-11 to 13-171-21. Section 13-171-14(c) provides in pertinent part: "If applications are made to continue existing uses which are competing and the uses otherwise meet the requirements of subchapter 3, the commission shall hold a hearing to determine the quantity of water that may be consumed and the conditions to be imposed on each existing use." Competing applications are those which "draw water from the same hydrologically controllable area and the aggregate quantity of water consumed by the users exceeds the appropriate sustainable yield or instream flow standards established pursuant to law for the area. *Id.* Each of the applications to continue an existing use draw water from the same area as the area from which Wailuku Water draws water. As such, the uses are competing if the quantity of water from the same hydrologic unit exceeds the instream flow standards. To make that determination, the Commission must first establish the instream flow standards. Until such time as the instream flow standard for each hydrologic unit is established, the Commission cannot process the permit applications without risking violation of its Administrative Rules and impermissibly effecting existing property rights.

2. **Permit Should Be Subject to PUC Approved Tariff and/or Applicable PUC Orders**

The granting of permit applications must be subject to compliance with applicable law. The application of utility law is relevant to the subject applications.

The rules applicable to the water permit process state: "If two or more applications . . . are pending for a quantity of water that is inadequate for both or all, or which for any other reason are in conflict, the commission shall first, seek to allocate water in such a manner as to accommodate both applications if possible; second, if mutual sharing is not possible, then the commission shall approve that application which best serves the public interest." H.Admin.R. § 13-171-16. Wailuku Water has an application pending before the Public Utilities Commission ("PUC") of the State of Hawaii to obtain a certificate of public necessity for the delivery of water to various users, including most if not all of the applicants for permits for existing uses. While this Commission has jurisdiction over the issuance and modification of water use permits, the PUC will have jurisdiction over the operations of Wailuku Water, including, but not limited to, areas of service, delivery rates, and other matters that have an impact on the determination which the Commission must make for competing applications which are in conflict.

3. **Appurtenant Rights are not determined in the permit application process and information submitted concerning appurtenant rights is irrelevant.**

Neither the State Water Code, H.Rev.Stat. Chapter 174C, nor the administrative rules dealing with water use permits in water management areas, H.Admin.R. §§ 13-171-11 to 13-171-21, provide a basis by which the Commission can or should determine whether appurtenant rights exist within the context of approving a water use permit. The purpose of the regulations under which the water use permit process is administered is to establish control over the withdrawal and diversion of surface water in threatened areas to ensure the most beneficial use, development and management of the water resources in those threatened areas. H.Admin.R. § 13-171-1. Addressing appurtenant rights, the Commission stated “Nothing in this part shall be construed to deny the exercise of an appurtenant right by the holder thereof at any time.” H.Admin.R. § 13-171-27. A similar statement is contained in the State Water Code. H.Rev.Stat. § 174C-63.

While the Commission is authorized by statute to determine appurtenant water rights, the Commission has not acted to adopt rules by which such a determination is to be made. H.Rev.Stat. § 174C-5(15). Until such time as the Commission adopts rules governing such determinations, persons wishing to establish an appurtenant right will be left to do so within the court system.

As the water use permit process clearly does not provide procedures by which appurtenant rights might be established, and as the applicant has not established any appurtenant right through a court proceeding, the inclusion of information concerning alleged appurtenant rights is irrelevant to the water use permit application proceeding.

4. **Permit Application Should Be Dismissed as No Existing Use of Surface Water is Claimed.**

The Applicant admits that no water is taken from a surface water hydrologic unit within the Na Wai Eha. The application states that it is for “surface water use.” Ground water use permit applications are the subject of a different form which must be completed by the applicant and involve different existing users who have been issued permits by this Commission. As such, the application should be dismissed as being improper as no surface water is being used or diverted for use.

5. **Improper Source Landowner’s Name.**

The Applicant identified the source landowner as Avery Chumbley or Waiehu Aina, LLC. Neither is a source landowner, nor are they owners of land that is the watershed source for any stream within the Na Wai Eha.

6. **Waste Complaints are Improper in the Context of a Water Use Permit Application.**

The Applicant asserts that Wailuku Water allows waste to occur. The question of waste is not raised or addressed in the portions of the State Water Code dealing with water use permits or in the portions of the Hawaii Administrative Rules applicable to water use permit applications. Accordingly, any claims of waste are irrelevant to a water use permit application and should be stricken. Further, Wailuku Water denies that any waste is or has occurred as claimed.

7. **Participation in process is limited to surface water hydrologic unit identified in Application.**

Competing applications are those which “draw water from the same hydrologically controllable area and the aggregate quantity of water consumed by the users exceeds the appropriate sustainable yield or instream flow standards established pursuant to law for the area. H.Admin.R. § 13-171-14(c). Applicant has no standing to participate in any permit application that is not within the same surface water hydrologic area. Wailuku Water objects to the applicant’s participation in any proceeding beyond that involving the surface water hydrologic unit identified in the application.

8. **Application Duplicates Another Use Application.**

The application duplicates another use application filed by the same applicant or seeks to duplicate the use of water for which application was made by another applicant.