

**Hawai'i 2050 Sustainability Task Force  
Hawai'i State Capitol, Room 309  
December 15, 2006  
Minutes**

Members Present: Senator Russell Kokubun, Representative Pono Chong, Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland, Ian Costa, Senator Mike Gabbard, David Goode, Marion Higa, Millie Kim, Keith Kurahashi, Representative Colleen Meyer, Keith Rollman, James Spencer, Jane Testa, Stacie Thorlakson, Beth Tokioka, Senator Jill Tokuda, Pamela Tumpap, Ryan Yamane

Members Not Present: Representative Lyla Berg, Henry Eng, Michael Foley, Karl Kim, Roy Takemoto, Laura Thielen

**I. Call to Order.** A quorum was established to begin the meeting. The task force meeting was called to order at 10:28 a.m. by Chair Russell Kokubun on Friday, December 15, 2006, in Room 309 at the Hawai'i State Capitol. Introduction of task force members. Chair Kokubun acknowledged receipt of resignation letters from both Senator Gary Hooser and Senator Fred Hemmings and thanked them for their support of the task force's efforts. With the resignation of Senators Hooser and Hemmings, President Colleen Hanabusa has appointed Senator Jill Tokuda and Senator Mike Gabbard to the task force. Chair Kokubun introduced and welcomed Senator Tokuda to the task force. Bill Kaneko also introduced Jeanne Schultz, Director of Public Policy for the Hawaii Institute for Public Affairs. She will assist with the Hawai'i 2050 Sustainability Task Force efforts.

Chair Kokubun also introduced newly elected Senate President, Senator Colleen Hanabusa. President Hanabusa shared her memories of a Senate retreat two years ago when she and Chair Kokubun were part of a sub-group that believed sustainability should be an overarching theme for the State. She thanked the task force for their continued efforts and also thanked the community who attend these meetings to share their views and concerns. President Hanabusa also shared that at a recent retreat, as a matter of a policy statement or majority package, the Senate adopted sustainability as an overarching theme for the upcoming session.

On behalf of the task force, Chair Kokubun expressed thanks to Carol Taniguchi for her hard work and dedication to the matters before the task force. Carol Taniguchi has taken the position of Chief Clerk of the Senate. Bill Kaneko also expressed his appreciation to Carol for her contributions to HIPA.

Chair Kokubun also acknowledged the receipt of a letter of resignation from Donald Fujimoto, representative from the County of Kaua'i. Donald Fujimoto will be working with Mayor Bryan Baptiste to name a replacement to the task force.

- II. Review and Approve Minutes.** Draft minutes from the November 17, 2006 meeting was distributed to members. Chair Kokubun opened discussion on the minutes. Chair Kokubun entertained a motion to approve the November 17, 2006 minutes. Representative Pono Chong moved to approve the minutes, Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland seconded the motion. Stacie Thorlakson requested that “via telephone” be placed by her name to indicate that although she was not physically present she participated in the meeting. Chair Kokubun concurred. The task force unanimously approved the November 17, 2006 minutes.

Chair Kokubun thanked the members of the audience for their attendance and interest in the task force meetings. He welcomed comments from the audience. A private citizen, suggested that the task force conduct an internet survey which would cost less than a telephone survey. Chair Kokubun acknowledged his suggestion, and stated that discussion on conducting an internet survey would occur later on the agenda.

- III. Review and Discussion on Task Force Attendance Policy.** At the November 17<sup>th</sup> meeting, discussion occurred on whether members felt the attendance policy was too stringent—members who missed three consecutive meetings would be asked to resign. Two reasons for adopting an attendance policy were (1) with the large number of members, quorum at times were difficult to attain; and (2) much work needs to be accomplished in a short period of time. Members suggested that the Chair be given some discretion in granting flexibility without the policy being applied. After further discussion with members, the Chair recommended that the policy be retained as adopted. Chair Kokubun thanked all members for their efforts in attending all meetings and entertained any further discussion on the policy. Millie Kim clarified that her intention in raising the issue at the last meeting was not to rescind the policy but to allow the Chair some flexibility in dealing with certain situations where members who miss their third meeting for good reason be given an exception to the rule. Should that situation arise, Chair Kokubun suggested that he will bring the issue to the task force and a decision would be made by the task force as a whole.

- IV. Update and Discussion of Community Engagement Working Group Activities.** Chair Kokubun commented that he has been very fortunate to attend all of the community meetings, and that the community has responded very positively to the sustainability efforts. Chair Kokubun thanked Leland Chang and Janis Reischmann for organizing the community engagement meetings. Janis Reischmann presented to the task force an update of the community engagement activities.

Four community meetings were held on O‘ahu—Mililani (Mililani Mauka Elementary School), Kailua, (Kailua High School), Kapolei (Kapolei Middle School), and Honolulu (McKinley High School). A good mix from the communities attended the meetings which resulted in exciting dialogue. A total of about 225 people attended the Oahu meetings—the largest turnout was at McKinley High School. The meeting format was conducted in the same manner as the meetings held on the neighbor islands. The meetings began with presentations from Chair Kokubun, Bill Kaneko and Sharon Miyashiro, Kanu Hawai‘i, and Ramsay Taum (O‘ahu meetings only) followed by an interactive segment. Participants were asked to comment on two questions—what words, ideas, phrases come to mind when you think about sustainability and Hawai‘i; then

select, prioritize, rank, order those words, ideas, phrases and who is responsible for sustainability? Consistent themes were received from the meetings—energy and food self-sufficiency; preservation and protection of natural and environmental resources and species; preservation, protection, and promotion of Hawaiian culture; and traditional Hawaiian ahupua‘a management processes and practices. The data from these meetings will be collected and prepared for the “next step” or phase I of community engagement.

In phase I, small groups or organizations such as a club, neighborhood board, or PTSA would host an informal meeting. A tool kit or user’s guide is being developed to support these meetings. Participants would be asked to make choices on three discrete areas that are moving us forward in terms of getting new content for a plan—definition of sustainability, vision for a sustainable Hawai‘i, and guiding principles for working towards a sustainable Hawai‘i. The tool kit will also be available on the H2050 website for individuals that may not be able to attend these smaller meetings. Each island has a “point person” or island coordinator, who will assist in getting the word out, using of the tool kit at the meetings or via the website, and informing the task force of the various scheduled meetings.

Chair Kokubun asked how do you intend to “get the word out” for these smaller meetings? Janis responded saying that it will probably be different from island to island. For example, Focus Maui Nui used various modalities in getting the word out for their community engagement activities—flyers, email blasts, paid advertising, and telemarketing. The islands of Moloka‘i and Lāna‘i will probably get their notices out by “word of mouth.” The Community Engagement Working Group also put together a list of groups to outreach to—Hawaiian civic clubs, PTSAs, teams, chambers of commerce, etc.

Representative Pono Chong asked was there a general theme of why people thought sustainability was important. Janis responded that she needs to review her data to be able to give him a more insightful answer. Janis added that many participants commented that they wanted to preserve, protect what is important to them and themes that surfaced are important to them. For example, affordable housing came up a lot at these meetings—in a sustainable Hawai‘i, there needs to be places for people to live, everyone should have a home. Representative Chong added looking at why sustainability is important could help in defining what sustainability is. Janis also stated that the vision phase would also cover why sustainability is important.

Dr. James Spencer commented that many times when we hear of sustainability it is in the context of sustainable development and it should be made clear whether the community is thinking in terms of how we maintain sustainability principles in the context of sustainability or sustainable development. Janis commented that Dr. Spencer makes a good point—when she was looking at different definitions often she found definitions for sustainability development and not just sustainability.

Shanah Trevenna, student coordinator for a University of Hawaii pilot project on sustainability, commented that students respond to other students and suggested having a student coordinator from each island to help organize meetings with students and youths.

Chair Kokubun inquired on when the tool kit could be shared with task force members. Janis responded that the CE working group will review the kit following this meeting and should be able to share a draft version with task force shortly. Janis also noted that the CE working group is working in phases—phase I, definition, vision, guiding principles; phase II, issue papers; and phase III, strategies and actions.

**Sector Outreach**

As part of community outreach, Bill Kaneko informed members of other activities that have been scheduled or are being planned. Bill announced the possibility of doing a survey with Hawai‘i Kids Voting. A meeting has been scheduled for January 5, 2007 with Pat Hamamoto, Superintendent of Education; Gail Mukaihata Hanneman, Girl Scouts; and Linda Coble, Hawai‘i Kids Voting. Bill and Chair Kokubun also met with Randy Perreira, President of the Hawai‘i State AFL-CIO. Chair Kokubun will be placed on the State/Federal docket on January 25, 2007 to present the 2050 plan in concept. The Hawai‘i Business 2050 Series will begin its 8-part series the last week of January and along with the series, a Hawai‘i Business Leader Workshop is being scheduled for February. Bennette Evangelista of Actus Lend Lease will spearhead the workshop. Chair Kokubun also added that the military is another group that the task force has outreached to. Chair Kokubun has also asked Hawai‘i Business Magazine to consider holding similar business series seminars on the neighbor islands.

- V. **Update of Research Activities.** Dr. Sharon Miyashiro presented an update on research activities. Authors are in the process of writing their issue papers and drafts are due to the editor by the end of December 2006. The editor will begin editing the papers as they are received. The editing of the drafts should be completed and presented to the task force at the January 2007 meeting. The final IssueBook will be taken back into the community in Phase II of the Community Engagement process. The research team is also working with the Office of State Planning in reviewing the data sets to develop indicators.

Jane Testa inquired if the issue papers will be integrated, having a unified message. Dr. Miyashiro responded that the common theme that should run through all papers are sustainability and what makes Hawai‘i unique and what are the choices. Dr. James Spencer is one of the authors of the issue papers and added that the issue of having a common theme among the different papers did arise and the writers were supportive that each should read and comment on the other’s papers. But given the timeline, the task would be difficult. Dr. Miyashiro also added that she is working with the editor and authors to ensure that the end product is one book and not separate pieces.

- VI. **Report of the Sustainability Definition Working Group.** The working group was tasked with creating a working definition of sustainability. The work group agreed that the definition should come from the community and recommended to create a working definition from community input collected from the community engagement meetings. Bill Kaneko presented to the task force a Report from the Sustainability Definition Working Group dated December 5, 2006. The working group agreed on various components and characteristics of sustainability to be integrated into the definition:

- Behavioral component which emphasizes how action now impacts our future;
- Identifies the end-user or stakeholder it applies to;
- Guides public and private actions;
- Future-oriented, long-term and visionary;
- The three pillars of sustainability: Ecology, Economy and Social/Cultural components;
- A process by which sustainability will be achieved.

The Community Engagement Working Group also intended to pose similar questions to the community in Phase I of the Community Engagement activities. The Sustainability Definition Working Group recommends to the task force that the working definition of sustainability be held pending receipt of data gathered by the Community Engagement Working Group. Representative Pono Chong motioned to approve the report of the Sustainability Definition Working Group, Pamela Tumpap seconded the motion. The task force unanimously approved the report.

**VII. Update on Public Education Working Group.** The task force approved the establishment of a Public Education Working Group at its November 17, 2006 meeting. The purpose of this working group is to educate the general public of the task force’s efforts. The working group will also be responsible for public relations aspects for the task force as well as working with the DOE in creating specific educational tools for the community. The following task force members have agreed to serve on the Public Education Working Group: Keith Rollman, Pamela Tumpap, Millie Kim, and Representative Lyla Berg. Chair Kokubun also solicited the members of the public to serve on the working group: Paul “Doc” Berry, Gail Mukaihata Hanneman or Barbara Blomgren of the Girl Scouts, Bennette Evangelista of Actus Lend Lease, and Shanah Trevenna. Representative Colleen Meyer volunteered to serve on the working group. The Public Education Working Group will meet at the conclusion of the task force meeting.

Pamela Tumpap inquired if the groups and organizations who signed-up at the Kick-off Event to be part of the sustainability efforts have been contacted. Bill Kaneko responded that they hear from various groups and organizations on their sustainability efforts but there is no formal mechanism of communication with these groups. Pamela would like to receive updates on what the various groups are doing.

Paul “Doc” Berry presented to the task force a revised public education/outreach for the State Task Force on Sustainability 2050 Plan.

Chair Kokubun solicited Lisa Oshiro from the Council for Native Hawaiian Advancement to represent her organization on the Public Education Working Group. Senator Jill Tokuda also volunteered to serve on the working group.

Member serving on the Public Education Working Group are as follows: Pamela Tumpap, Keith Rollman, Senator Jill Tokuda, Representative Lyla Berg, Millie Kim, Representative Colleen Meyer, Bennette Evangelista, Paul “Doc” Berry, Gail Mukaihata Hanneman, Shanah Trevenna, and Lisa Oshiro. Beth Tokioka moved to establish a

Public Education Working Group, Representative Colleen Meyer seconded the motion. The task force unanimously approved the motion.

Chair Kokubun informed the task force that he received an invitation to participate in Hawai'i Public Television's Island Insights program. The program's format consists of spirited discussion on various issues affecting the State. Chair Kokubun, Ramsay Taum, and James Koshiba were invited to the program to discuss sustainability efforts. The moderator of the program was Dan Boylan. The program will be aired on Christmas Day. Mr. Boylan also writes a column in the MidWeek and will devote some column space towards sustainability efforts and to the task force itself.

**VIII. Update and Review Hawai'i 2050 Project Timeline.** Bill Kaneko presented to the task force a proposed timeline for the period December 2006 to July 2008. One of the key benchmarks for the task force is to provide a draft report by September 2007. Working backwards, drafting of the report should begin in June 2007. The timeline outlined various components of the plan development process—Overall Management, Community Engagement, Research, Public Education, Definition, Indicator Development, Governance, and Stakeholder Outreach.

Overall Management:

June 2007	begin drafting of report
September 2007	finalize draft for public comment
December 2007	submit final report to 2008 Regular Session
July 2008	possible closing summit

Community Engagement:

December 2006	Phase I, development of definition, vision, and guiding principles
February 2007	interactive website
March 2007	Phase II, indicators, choices, activities
*March 2007	<i>proposed Survey I, telephone or website</i>
June 2007	final report from CEWG
*June 2007	<i>proposed Survey II, telephone or website</i>
August 2007	Phase III, CE presentations/guest speakers
September 2007	Kids Voting survey
October 2007	Phase IV, feedback on draft report
January 2008	Phase V, community presentations

\*Surveys I and II have not been budgeted for in task force's appropriation.

Research:

December 2006	submit issue paper raw drafts
February 2007	finalize issue paper drafts
March 2007	prepare issue papers for printing

Public Education:

December 2006	continues throughout timeline period
---------------	--------------------------------------

Definition:

December 2006	begin drafting of report
September 2007	finalize draft for public comment
December 2007	submit final report to 2008 Regular Session
July 2008	possible closing summit

Indicator Development:

March 2007	identify existing data
May 2007	finalize indicators, forward to Governance and CE Working Groups

Governance:

December 2006	identify stakeholders
February 2007	begin
July 2007	submit recommendations

Stakeholder Outreach:

December 2006	out reach to various stakeholders
---------------	-----------------------------------

Jane Testa inquired if Survey I and II were to be conducted by either telephone or web or that there would be a web survey and maybe a telephone survey. Bill Kaneko clarified by saying that the interactive website that will be operable in February 2007 is via the H2050 website and different from Surveys I and II. Both Surveys I and II will be designed by a professional survey/research company and be either a web survey or telephone survey. There are pros and cons between the two surveys—a web driven survey tends to capture younger people (more web literate) and a telephone survey tends to capture a broader base of recipients. Bill also reminded members that the surveys are unbudgeted. Jane Testa also asked if the surveys were budgeted for, could both types of surveys be conducted. Bill responded that he believes that the surveys would have to be either and not both because even if the same questions were asked in both the web and telephone surveys, the responses would be different—visual versus audible. Bill also suggested seeking private funding to conduct the surveys. Chair Kokubun added that if Surveys I and II were conducted via the web, each would cost approximately \$50,000. Telephone surveys would cost more due to the manpower conducting the survey.

Keith Kurahashi agreed with the importance of a telephone survey and that it would reach more of the general population. Kevin Killen, member of the audience, commented that many individuals use cellular phones and do not have land lines and suggested seeking assistance from the universities to have students take people surveys as part of course assignments.

- IX. Discussion on the Hawai'i 2050 Budget.** The combined budgets for Phases I, II and III were presented to the task force. Marion Higa presented a summary of the task force's administrative costs for fiscal years 2005-2006 and 2006-2007. The original legislation creating the task force appropriated \$100,000 for each of the two years of the task force. Each year's appropriation was divided into two—\$25,000 for the operations of the task force itself and \$75,000 for contract work. In fiscal year 2005-2006 (October 2005-June 2006), \$12,060.47 was expended for office supplies, postage, printing, automobile

mileage and parking, airfares and ground transportation, other travel, and other expenses. In the current fiscal year (July 2006-November 2006), \$8,053.45 has been expended for office supplies, printing, automobile mileage and parking, airfares and ground transportation, other travel, and other expenses. Some of the Kick-off Event’s expenses were also expended from the current fiscal year’s appropriation. In both fiscal years, a major portion of the expenses comes from air and ground transportation for neighbor island members. Marion also noted that personnel costs for supporting the task force are not included in these expenses and are being expended from Office of the Auditor’s operating budget. Printing of the issue papers submitted by the UH Research team will also be expended from the Auditor’s budget. The final report is a separate issue.

Marion presented an overview of the task force’s combined budgets. The Hawaii Institute for Public Affairs (HIPA) was awarded the first contract of \$75,000 for each of the two years of the task force. Four months into the first contract, it was realized that the \$75,000 appropriation would not cover the expenses for activities planned for the fiscal year including the kick-off event. As part of the Office of the Auditor’s operating budget, the legislature appropriates an additional \$150,000 for the Auditor to conduct studies not previously appropriated for. Approval from the Senate President and House Speaker was granted to use the \$150,000 to enter into a second contract for the remainder of the first year. The second contract was awarded to HIPA. Through the efforts of Representative Ryan Yamane, Chair Kokubun, and members of the task force, the 2006 Legislature appropriated an additional \$650,000 to the task force’s budget. Since the appropriation was half of what the task force had originally requested, the projected personnel costs was deleted from the task force’s budget and expended from the Auditor’s operating budget. HIPA was awarded the third contract. Including the \$50,000 appropriated for administrative costs of the task force, a total of \$1 million has been appropriated towards the efforts of the task force.

The budgets were displayed in several categories:

	<b>\$ Budgeted</b>	<b>%</b>
Project Management (HIPA)	\$231,000	24.32
Task Force Meetings and Facilitation	17,000	1.79
Research and Analysis (UH)	204,500	21.53
Community Engagement	316,100	33.27
Governance	68,500	7.21
Public Education	25,500	2.68
Other Direct Project Costs	39,900	4.20
HIPA Overhead	47,500	5.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$950,000</b>	<b>100.00</b>

Marion noted that looking at the timeline presented earlier, at the end of Phase III (June 30, 2007), no funds are available for the Hawai‘i 2050 Sustainability Task Force. The 2006 appropriation is only available until the end of the current fiscal year. The legislature had recommended that the task force request for additional funding at the



2007 legislative session. All activities, including the surveys, shown on the timeline after June 30, 2007 are currently unfunded.

Keith Kurahashi asked if the in-kind contributions listed under the Project Management and Research and Analysis categories donations from HIPA and UH. Bill Kaneko responded that the in-kind contributions included time contributed by Carol Taniguchi, Dr. Miyashiro, and himself. Keith thanked Bill, Carol, and Sharon for donating their time. Representative Colleen Meyer asked if HIPA was the contractor listed under Community Engagement. Marion responded saying that the contractors were Leland Chang and Janis Reischmann, independent facilitators contracted for the CE meetings. Beth Tokioka commented that she appreciates the presentation made on the budget. At the last meeting she had questions on the allocation of funds and thought that the CE portion may be under funded, but now sees that CE received a large portion of the budget and actually public education is under funded. She hopes the next appropriation will have more funds allocated to public education. Millie Kim asked if there was an estimate of what the activities projected in the next fiscal year would cost. Chair Kokubun responded saying that he is working with Bill and Marion on the projected costs. Bill added that initial estimates producing a comprehensive plan would cost approximately \$3 million. Chair Kokubun also commented that the legislators have full acknowledgement that in order for the task force to bring forward a plan by 2008, additional funding is needed. Stacie Thorlakson inquired if the Summit listed under Community Engagement was expenses incurred for the August 2006 Kick-off Event and if the \$20.50 charged to participants was used to defray the kick-off expenses and was it beneficial to collect that amount. Bill responded by clarifying that if participants were charged a minimal fee to attend, they would be more likely to attend the event. Bill also added that the Kick-off Event was approximately \$25,000 over budget. Dr. James Spencer asked if there were any negative comments regarding the \$20.50 charged to participants. Bill commented that they did not receive any negative comments. Pamela Tumpap also added that scholarships were also available to participants.

Chair Kokubun informed the task force that the appropriation should be a separate bill and that the deadline for bill submittal is January 24, 2007. Although you are able to insert a blank amount, he prefers to have an estimated amount in the bill. Chair Kokubun requested that HIPA email members a sound estimate to continue this effort and members give their feedback to HIPA. Bill will use the timeline as benchmarks to develop budget. Jane Testa acknowledged HIPA for the phenomenal work they have done with what was budgeted and for all additional things the task force has requested. Stacie Thorlakson suggested having an hour-long television special instead of the closing summit. Pamela Tumpap suggested that the Public Education Working Group get their ideas to Bill as soon as possible so that it could be incorporated into the budget.

Shannon Wood, member of the audience, inquired whether foundations and businesses have been approached for funding and not only using public funds. Chair Kokubun responded that the task force has looked at other means of funding and is seeking partnerships with organizations that have an interest in sustainability. Beth Tokioka suggested that the budget should include cash in-kind donations as well as other donations that a value could be put to, for example, media opportunities.

**X. Update and Discussion of Other Sustainability Activities.** Chair Kokubun made presentations to various organizations on the task force's work.

- Hawai'i Leeward Planning Conference, December 1, 2006  
A group from the Big Island comprised primarily of major land owners and businesses on the west side of the island.
- U.S. Department of Defense Environmental Forum, December 12, 2006  
Representative Marcus Oshiro and Senator Gary Hooser also participated in the forum.
- Island Insights, Hawai'i Public Television, December 25, 2006  
Ramsay Taum and James Koshiba also participated on the program which was moderated by Dan Boylan.

Chair Kokubun informed the task force that he would like to have this agenda item on future agendas and encouraged all members to share any opportunity available to promote sustainability efforts.

Shannon Wood, member of the audience, informed the task force that she will be attending an International Conference on Sustainability the first week of January in Nashville, Tennessee. The conference will be hosted by former Vice President Al Gore and will focus on the environment, energy, and global warming.

Jane Testa shared that the Hawai'i County Department of Research and Development is in the process of changing the county ordinance by redefining the department's mission in the broader context of sustainability and applying it to the areas of tourism, economic development, agriculture, energy, and film and well as the community development pieces.

**XI. Next Steps; Plan for Future Meetings.** Chair Kokubun commented that with the 2007 Legislative Session beginning on January 17, 2007, legislative members will not be able to devote an entire day to task force meetings. The task force would need to look at the working groups to perform majority of the work and report back to the task force. The task force will also have limited access to Conference Room 309, but may have access to Conference Room 414. The task force will still need to look at other venues for meeting sites. Chair Kokubun would like to have the meeting sites consistent not only for task force members but also to members of the public. Chair Kokubun would like to continue with the task force's monthly meetings scheduled for the third Friday of each month. Representative Colleen Meyer noted that both house enter into legislative session in the mornings. Chair Kokubun suggested that the January meeting be set but to hold off scheduling remaining meetings until the legislative calendar has been approved. He also requested that legislative members hold legislative recess days for task force work. Stacie Thorlakson commented that she is in favor of Friday morning meetings to avoid Friday afternoon traffic to the airport.

Chair Kokubun suggested holding the January meeting on Thursday, January 18, 2007, from 1:00 to 4:00 p.m. Chair Kokubun also invited task force member to attend Opening

Day festivities. He is gathering tickets for members to sit in the Senate Gallery and would like the Senate President to recognize task members. Please inform Bill if you are available to attend Opening Day on Wednesday, January 17, 2007. Session will begin at 10:00 a.m. but members are asked to arrive at 9:00 a.m.

- XII. Adjourn.** Chair Kokubun thanked members of the task force and the audience for their attendance and wished everyone a Merry Christmas. The meeting was adjourned at 1:28 p.m. by Chair Kokubun.