

**Hawai'i 2050 Sustainability Task Force
Hawai'i State Capitol, Room 309
August 11, 2006
Minutes**

Members Present: Representative Lyla Berg, Representative Pono Chong, Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland, Henry Eng, Michael Foley, Donald Fujimoto, David Goode, Senator Fred Hemmings, Marion Higa, Karl Kim, Millie Kim, Keith Kurahashi, Kem Lowry, Keith Rollman, Laura Thielen, Beth Tokioka, Pamela Tumpap, Representative Ryan Yamane

- I. **Call to Order.** A quorum was established to begin the meeting. Chair Kokubun was unable to attend the August 11th meeting and requested that member Marion Higa preside over the meeting. The task force meeting was called to order at 10:15 a.m. by Marion Higa on Friday, August 11, 2006, in Room 309 at the Hawai'i State Capitol. Introduction of task force members and support staff.
- II. **Review and Approve Minutes.** A copy of the "DRAFT" minutes for July 21, 2006 was distributed to members of the task force. Marion Higa opened discussion on the "DRAFT" minutes of the July 21st task force meeting. Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland moved to approve the minutes; Donald Fujimoto seconded the motion. The July 21, 2006 minutes was unanimously approved by the task force.
- III. **Update on August 26 Kick-off Event.** Bill Kaneko of the Hawaii Institute for Public Affairs (HIPA) presented an update on the August 26th Kick-off Event to the task force.
 - **Registration.** As of August 10th, a total 190 registrations were received. It is anticipated that by the registration deadline, 450 participants will have registered for the event. 8,000 brochures were printed and 7,000 were distributed throughout the state.
 - **Program/Timeline.** Jim Dator of the UH research team was working on adding more community engagement activities into the event. All of the event speakers have been confirmed—Bill Bradbury, Oregon Secretary of State; Governor George Ariyoshi; Kanu Hawai'i. Donna Ching will join Robbie Alm as the event's co-moderators.
 - **Scholarships.** Neighbor island task force members will award scholarships to their respective island recipients. A list of scholarship recipients should be forwarded to HIPA.
 - **Ground Transportation.** Chartered buses will shuttle participants from the airport to the Dole Ballrooms in the morning and from the Dole Ballrooms to the airport in the afternoon. Volunteers will guide participants to chartered buses. The chartered bus

schedule as well as a City and County of Honolulu bus schedule will be distributed to neighbor island participants.

- **Broadcast.** Live broadcasts will be available statewide on public access stations `Olelo (Oahu), Akaku (Maui), Na Leo o Hawai`i (Hawai`i) and Ho`ike (Kaua`i).
- **Sponsors.** Jeff Stone, Princeville Resort and the Resort Group, has generously agreed to underwrite the cost of the live statewide broadcast.
- **Media.** Bennette Evangelista, Actus Lend Lease, has volunteered to chair the education and media promotion for task force activities. Carol Taniguchi from HIPA coordinated with Olomana Marketing in launching the Hawai`i 2050 website in late July. The website is very well done and approximately 50 percent of the participants registered for the kick-off event online. HIPA is working on providing users the ability to login comments and/or questions and have them posted on the website.
- **Reception.** HIPA has contacted an organization to sponsor the reception to close the kick-off event.
- **“Going Forward.”** Participants will leave the kick-off with information on planned events scheduled for the last week of September. At least one event is being planned for each island.

IV. Report on Community Engagement and Public Education Plan and Activities.

County of Maui: Chair Russell Kokubun and Pamela Tumpap met with Mayor Arakawa and some county council members to discuss task force efforts. Council members questioned why there is no council representation on the task force since county/city councils pass ordinances and deal with development issues and suggested involving the Hawai`i State Association of Counties (HSAC) in this movement. Another concern of the council was that there was no representation from each individual island. Representatives from Moloka`i and Lāna`i should have been considered to participate in the task force. In addressing the council’s concerns, scholarship moneys are being set aside for Moloka`i and Lāna`i and assistance is being sought from council members representing those islands to encourage participation. The Kick-off Event has been promoted through the Chamber of Commerce’s e-news, which goes out to 900 members. Brochures were also distributed to Kamehameha Schools-Maui. Geographic Information System (GIS) maps on county planning were also shared with the task force. The maps provide research and material sets which could be used by the task force.

County of Kaua`i: Beth Tokioka, Donald Fujimoto, and Senator Gary Hooser presented the overall function and goals of the task force to the Kaua`i County Council. They also informed the council of the August 26 Kick-off Event. Broadcast of the council meeting aired throughout the following week on Kaua`i’s public access station. The council members were receptive to task force efforts.

Hawai'i Conservation Conference: Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland attended portions of the conference held on July 26-28 at the Hawai'i Convention Center. The theme of the conference was Sustainability: Mauka to Makai. The opening speaker, Dr. Thomas Goreau, gave a very interesting presentation on the issue of global warming and the effects on the environment. The information was presented in a scientific way that was understood by everyone.

Small Islands Conference. Mike Foley attended the International Small Islands Studies Association's 2006 Conference—Islands of the World IX held July 29 to August 4 at the Maui Community College, University of Hawai'i. The theme of the conference was Sustainable Islands—Sustainable Strategies. Two of the speakers were David Cole of Maui Land & Pineapple Company and Bill McDonough, author of *Cradle-to-Cradle*. Much of the conference discussions centered around global warming and sea level rise. Zoe Norcross Nu'u, Maui Community College, UH Sea Grant Program, presented an interesting computer simulation on potential sea rise impacts on Hawai'i.

PBS Hawai'i. On August 7, 2006, PBS Hawai'i began airing a six-part series on sustainability titled *design:e²*. The series explores the vitality of the environment through eco-friendly architecture and is narrated by actor Brad Pitt. Henry Eng distributed a brief description of the six episodes. The first three are scheduled for August 7, 14, and 21. The last three episodes have not been scheduled yet.

Public Education and Media Education. Bennette Evangelista will oversee public education and media promotion for task force activities. HIPA is also seeking the assistance of an account executive from the public relations community to design brochures and produce press releases of upcoming community engagements and public education activities.

Community Engagement and Public Education. Donna Ching and Lily Bloom Domingo will assist in designing a planning process for the community engagement activities to begin after the kick-off. They will be contacting the respective county member representatives to determine where the counties are in their planning process, where they want to go, what their needs are, and how best to integrate the Hawai'i 2050 process into existing county planning efforts. The process will begin with larger meeting where a model will be provided; smaller meetings will follow with facilitation instructions and protocols to ensure consistency of message and data gathering.

Task force members requested that the broadcast of the Kick-off Event be rebroadcast as many times as possible to give those who were unable to attend or watch the event an opportunity to be part of the planning process. Jim Dator informed the task force that they could edit the future scenarios into 15-minute segments which could then be played at community engagements. HIPA will also look into posting video segments onto the website.

HIPA asked for feedback from the county task force representatives on the resources needed for each county to coordinate community education and engagement activities.

Beth Tokioka responded that Kaua‘i County would probably have to contract with a non-profit organization and there is an organization that focuses on this type of work. Mike Foley responded that Maui County could incorporate community outreach efforts through their General Plan update meetings and would ask Pamela Tumpap to coordinate community outreach efforts through her colleagues. David Goode added that outreach efforts must also include meetings on Moloka‘i and Lāna‘i. Henry Eng stated that the City and County of Honolulu is updating its development and sustainable community plans. The City’s neighborhood boards meet monthly to discuss various issues pertaining to their communities and could be used as a vehicle for community outreach.

The task force discussed ways the various counties could raise interest and community involvement in task force efforts. Mike Foley spoke of Focus Maui Nui’s efforts in community engagement reaching out to unconventional groups like the Boy Scouts, Girl Scouts and various churches. Their first outreach effort, reaching over 1,700 people, proved successful. Mike pointed out that this was the combined effort of consultants and volunteers and was not inexpensive. He also emphasized the need for talented coordinators to train volunteers. Doc Berry suggested that in order to transform society’s consciousness towards sustainability, available avenues of television, university talents, Chris Lee, and others might be tapped to develop a semester-long course which creates a half-hour documentary on sustainability issues concerning the State followed by discussion. This undertaking would be expensive but Doc Berry volunteered his services. Keith Rollman offered his assistance and suggested creating a separate working group to research the feasibility of this undertaking and submit its findings to the task force. Keith Kurahashi suggested that as a homework assignment, grade and middle school students could take home a one- or two-page form on the concepts and ideas of sustainability for their parents to fill out. This could provide an opportunity to educate the public and solicit input from those who may not have time to attend meetings but would like to participate. Laura Thielen, a former Board of Education member, expressed concerns about adding new curriculum in schools. The school’s primary goal is to educate students and there are many elementary school students entering middle schools who are unable to read or do basic math. The schools need to focus on the standard subjects like reading, mathematics, science, etc. Any effort to develop curriculum on sustainability needs to be integrated with the standards, which is a complex task. Beth Tokioka asked if students could be given a writing assignment in their English class in which they could ask their parents questions on sustainability. Laura commented that the DOE receives many requests to add ideas/assignments to students’ curriculum, but these requests are not accompanied with an objective or plan on how it could be integrated into the standard curriculum. Lyla Berg suggested using programs that are already established in the DOE curriculum, for example, Leader for the Day program. Representative Ryan Yamane suggested having business cards with contact and website information made and these cards could then be distributed at various events—beach clean-ups, recycling drives, etc.—to solicit interest in task force efforts. Keith Rollman would also like the website to include a survey to gather data.

- V. **Report on Research and Governance Activities.** Dr. Christopher Grandy, UH support team, distributed a summary of academic literature on sustainability indicators and an

assessment of their effectiveness. It is difficult to connect indicators to actual public policy—to turn indicator efforts into public policy initiatives. One major reason is that indicators tend to be descriptive of phenomena is occurring—describing something and knowing what to do about it. Indicators should not be developed by “experts,” but in a collaborative/participatory process, not only by the community but also decision makers who have a direct influence on public policy. Research indicates that the process of developing indicators may be more important than having a set of indicators and merges with the policy making process.

Indicators need to be:

- homegrown,
- reflect the political and policy quirks of the community,
- an institutional mechanism to give decision makers incentives to consider indicators that will have an effect on policy,
- small and focused rather than larger and comprehensive

A single sustainability index is not recommended. The index is not transparent and needs to be explained whenever presented. Developing indicators is a long-term investment that takes time, thought, and resources. On average, it takes two or three years to develop three or four indicators.

Dr. Grandy recommends the following:

1. Consider making the development of sustainability indicators a much larger portion of the Hawai‘i 2050 sustainability effort.
2. Design a process for involving policy decision makers in developing sustainability indicators.
3. Start with a goal of developing a small set of indicators, looking at areas where there is agreement that something needs to be done.
4. Recognize that the process will take time and that the process is the outcome.
5. Indicator development group should find mechanism to incentivize use of, or reference to, indicators by policy makers.

Jim Hollyer, UH support team, reported on the process of collecting data. At a meeting with Donna Ching, they discussed the type of information to be collected during the group process at the Kick-off Event. Issues of interest (housing, labor, etc.) gathered from meetings will be compiled, and researchers can determine whether data is already available on these issues. The task force should seek the assistance of existing data sources (e.g., DBEDT, Office of Planning, UH, counties, etc.). Once the data is collected, it should be presented in a way that is user friendly. One suggestion is the idea

of a computer dashboard—the ability to go to one website, pull data from various sources, and display the data in the same place.

Governance Working Group Recommendations. Action was taken on the Governance Working Group’s (GWG) recommendations presented at the July 21st task force meeting.

The recommendations were:

- **Community Engagement.** Two types of engagement processes were suggested: small group sessions and larger community meetings on each island.
- **Research Process.** Preliminary research should commence on items HIPA and the UH research team determine to be baseline information and items likely to be priority issues.
- **Governance Process.** A stakeholder group should be identified and selected (state/county government, labor, community and private sector participants) to conceptualize a governing and implementation scheme and select benchmarks and indicators.
- **Timeline, Venue & Subject Matter.** Further discussion between HIPA and UH research team to elaborate on the timeline, venue, and subject matter for moving forward on the community engagement, research, and governance activities.

Pamela Tumpap moved to adopt the recommendations; Beth Tokioka seconded the motion. Discussion on the recommendations was opened to the task force. The recommendations are supported by the GWG and it was noted that a lot of discussion occurred prior to the group’s submittal of the recommendations. The recommendations submitted by the GWG were unanimously adopted by the task force.

VI. Report of the Hawai‘i 2050 Sustainability Working Group. A working group was created to propose a working definition of sustainability to the task force. The Sustainability Definition Working Group (SDWG) was comprised of members Representative Lyla Berg, Laura Thielen, Kem Lowry, and Ramsay Taum and Bill Kaneko. After an exchange of email over several days, the SDWG met and discussed two options: 1) the task force to create a working definition for review and comment by the public, and 2) to encourage the community to develop a definition. The SDWG agreed to recommend the second option but recognized that in order for the task to be effective, the task force would need to provide the community with examples. Packets of different sustainability definition would be put together and distributed at community engagement meetings. Kirsten Baumgart Turner suggested the “scientific” definition and guiding principles of sustainability be included in the definition packet. The SDWG presented to the task force their recommendation for action to be taken at the next task force meeting:

Encourage the community to develop a working definition of sustainability. The definition should include:

- A broad over-arching definition of sustainability;

- Guiding principles, values, descriptions or criteria which provide in greater detail sub-components of sustainability;
- Examples of “best practices” or activities which are in accord with the definition and guiding principles of sustainability.

The SDWG recognized that there may be multiple definitions of sustainability from different communities, interest groups and jurisdictions; and that defining sustainability will require a process of discussing, learning and understanding sustainability from various perspectives and vantage points.

The SDWG recommends that examples from other jurisdictions, organization, interest groups, and constituents (both in Hawai‘i and outside Hawai‘i) be presented to the community as a point of reference in defining sustainability. An all-encompassing state definition that is reflective of the unique characteristics and needs of our island community will need to be reached and agreed upon.

The SDWG also recommends that it work closely with the community engagement consultants to determine questions and process that may be most appropriate (including what settings) to define sustainability. The community meetings should include a discussion and survey of participants on the criteria to be included in a definition of sustainability, and the key resources, values, and opportunities to be included in either the definition or guiding principles of sustainability.

VII. Next Steps; Plan for Future Meetings. On August 3, 2006, the Office of the Auditor placed a public notice in the Honolulu Star Bulletin and posted on the State Procurement Office and Office of the Auditor websites a request for Statement of Qualifications and Letters of Interest for firms and individuals interested in providing technical assistance to the State Auditor and the Hawai‘i 2050 Task Force. Statement of Qualifications allows the assessment of the capability of potential contractors. The selection of a contractor shall be made from the list of qualified respondents shortly after the August 24 submittal deadline.

Task Force meetings are scheduled for the third Friday of each month. The next three meetings are scheduled for September 15th, October 20th, and November 17th. Some members questioned the need to meet every month, especially with community engagements scheduled for the end of September. Marion will apprise Chair Kokubun of the members’ concerns. Beth Tokioka commented on the need to have a meeting in September to debrief on the kick-off event and touch bases before the community engagements and requested that issue of monthly meeting be taken up at that time.

Senator Suzanne Chun Oakland noted the upcoming Children and Youth Summit on October 20, 2006 which will focus on sustainability issues. The summit will be held at the State Capitol from 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.

VIII. Adjourn. Marion Higa entertained the motion to adjourn. Pamela Tumpap motioned to adjourn the meeting; Representative Pono Chong seconded the motion. The meeting was adjourned at 2:10 p.m. by Marion Higa.