MINUTES FOR THE
MEETING OF THE
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

DATE: FRIDAY, JANUARY 14, 2005
TIME: 9:00 A.M.
PLACE: KAUAI WAR MEMORIAL CONVENTION HALL
4191 HARDY STREET
LIHUE, HI 96766

Chairperson Peter Young called the meeting of the Board of Land and Natural Resources to order at 9:03 a.m. The following were in attendance:

MEMBERS

Mr. Peter Young
Mr. Ted Yamamura
Mr. Toby Martyn

Mr. Timothy Johns
Mr. Gerald DeMello
Mr. Ron Agor

STAFF

Ms. Dede Mamiya, Land
Ms. Lauren Tanaka, Parks
Mr. Paul Conry, DOFAW

Mr. Dan Quinn, Parks
Mr. Jim Springer, Parks

OTHER

Mr. William Wynhoff, Deputy Attorney General
Mr. Richard Weisner, D-29
Mr. Bill Dever, D-28
Ms. Janell Hughes, E-2
Mr. Andy Johnston, E-2
Ms. Julia Nakaya, E-2
Mr. Frank Hay, E-2
Mr. John Plews, E-2
Mr. Wayne Jacinto, E-2
Mr. David Calahan, E-2
Mr. Canen Hookano, E-2

Mr. Peter Star, D-28
Mr. Paul Matsunaga, E-2
Ms. Claire Mortimer, E-2
Ms. Pat Finberg, E-2
Mr. Zachary Davis, E-2
Mr. Juan Wilson, E-2
Ms. Marsha Erickson, E-2
Mr. Benjamin Kali, E-2
Mr. Donn Carswell, E-2

(Note: language for deletion is [bracketed], new/added is underlined)
Item A-i: Minutes of December 10, 2004

Member Yamamura and Member DeMello recused themselves

Unanimously approved as submitted (Johns/Agor).


Dede Mamiya, Administrator of the Land Division conveyed the subject documents included a restriction that limits the use of the land to agriculture that is defined as truck and orchard crops and the applicant is seeking a waiver of these restrictions. Ms. Mamiya indicated she has discussed the proposed waiver of restrictions with the Department of Agriculture (DOA) and they’ve indicated no objections. Ms. Mamiya recommended the Board find that the restrictions on Agricultural use as contained in both Land Patent Grant No. S-15, 315 and Load Office Deed No. S-26,644 is not in the public interest pursuant to Chapter 171-63 HRS and authorizes the waiver of the use restrictions.

Unanimously approved as submitted (DeMello/Yamamura).

Item D-2: Grant of Term, Non-Exclusive Easement to Oren and Jo-Ann Leong for House Deck Overhang, Kaneohe, Koolaupoko, Oahu, TMK: (1) 4-6-22:25 seaward.

Ms. Mamiya disclosed a survey map provided by the applicants showing a wooden pier and a portion of the overhanging house deck to be encroaching onto State lands. The area of encroachment is approximately 45 square feet. Staff from the Office of Conservation and Coastal Lands (OCCL) has determined that the encroaching deck overhang would have no adverse impact on beach resources should it remain in place. Ms. Mamiya is asking that no fines be assessed since the encroachment is less than 100 square feet. Ms. Mamiya recommended the Board authorize the issuance of a 55-year term, non-exclusive easement for house deck overhang purposes to Oren and Jo-Ann Leong under the terms and conditions cited in the submittal.

Unanimously approved as submitted (Johns/DeMello).


Ms. Mamiya announced PCCP/LDC Pearl Kai, LLC has made an arrangement to have the subject lease transferred to Vallejo Venture 99, LLC a company in which a principal of PCCP is also the principal in the company. The applicant is also requesting consent of a mortgage of $10 million dollars. Ms. Mamiya recommended the Board consent to the assignment of General Lease No. S-4644 from PCCP/LDC, Pearl Kai LLC., as Assignor, to Vallejo Venture
99, LLC., as Assignor and consent to the mortgage between Vallejo Venture 99, LLC, Mortgagor, and Bear Stearns Commercial Mortgage, Inc., Mortgagee, in an amount not to exceed 10 million.

Unanimously approved as submitted (Johns/Martyn).

Item D-29: Consent to Assign General Lease Nos. S-4878, S-4740, Grant of Easement Bearing GL Nos. S-4645, S-4244, and Grant of Easement Bearing LOD Nos. S-12,850 and S-27,442, Wailua Associates, Assignor, to Coco Palms Ventures LLC, Assignee; Cancellation of Revocable Permit Nos. S-6233 and S-6234 Issued to Wailua Associates; and Reissuance of Revocable Permits to Coco Palms Ventures LLC Wailua, Kawaihau, Kauai, TMKs: (4) 4-1-05, 17, (4) 4-1-03: 05, 17, por. 39 and por.44.

Ms. Mamiya confirmed Wailua Associates is requesting consent to assign 2 general leases, 2 term easements, 2 perpetual easements and 2 revocable permits which are part of the Coco Palms Hotel Complex. The Coco Palms Hotel was severely damaged on September 11, 1992 by Hurricane Iniki and because of disputes over repairs the hotel has been closed since then. Currently, Coco Palms Ventures LLC has applied for a Special Management Area Permit to extensively renovate the property. The Lessee is in compliance with all lease terms. Ms. Mamiya recommended the Board consent to the assignment of General Lease Nos. S-44878 and S-4740, Grant of Easement Bearing GL Nos. S-4645 and S-4244 and Grant of Easement Bearing LOD Nos. S-12,850 and S-27,442, Wailua Associates Assignor to Coco Palms Ventures LLC, Assignee, authorize the issuance of replacement revocable permits to Coco Palms Ventures LLC covering the subject areas of Revocable Permit Nos. S-6233 and S-6234, authorize the cancellation of Revocable Permit Nos. S-6233 and S-6234 to Wailua Associates upon the execution of the replacement revocable permits to Coco Palms Ventures, LLC and if the proposed sale of Coco Palms Hotel fails to close for any reason, consent to the reassignment of General Lease Nos. S-4878 and S-4740, Grant of Easement Bearing GL Nos. S-4645 and S-4244 and Grant of Easement Bearing LOD Nos. S-12,850 and S-27,442 from Coco Palms Ventures LLC, Assignor to Wailua Associates, Assignee subject to the terms and conditions listed in staff's submittal.

Richard Weisner, Managing Partner came forward to let the Board know that his company has submitted a their request for permits to the County of Kauai but the planning commissioner has not acted on this request.

Unanimously approved as submitted (Agor/Martyn).


Chairperson Young recused himself.

Ms. Mamiya communicated the current lessee, Lanpar/HTL Associates is requesting to assign the subject perpetual easement to Global Resort Partners as they have acquired the
lease interest. A sister cooperation of Global Resort Partners now intends to purchase the fee simple interest in the lands underlying the Hilton Waikoloa Village from Lanpar/HTL Associates. Ms. Mamiya reminded those present of the Board’s actions to resolve the compensation issue as mandated by the court order in Napeahi v. State and staff does not believe the subject transfer will hamper or negatively effect the consummation of the resolution in any way. Ms. Mamiya noted that as a courtesy staff notified the Office of Hawaiian Affairs and Native Hawaiian Legal Corporation of this agenda item.

Peter Star, attorney for Global Resort Partners revealed that they’ve been in discussion with Lanpar/HTL Associates to purchase the fee simple interest in the lands underlying the Hilton Waikoloa Village. Mr. Star pointed out the 1986 assignment of the perpetual easement was never consummated.

Bill Dever, attorney for Lanpar/HTL Associates was present to answer questions.

Written testimony was also received from the Office of Hawaiian Affairs (OHA).

The Board asked staff to keep OHA informed on what was happening with this issue.

The Board amended Paragraph 1 of the Recommendation Section by clarifying that the Board’s consent to the assignment are for both periods from 1993 to May 30, 2061 and from May 31, 2061 in perpetuity.

Unanimously approved as amended by the remaining Board members (DeMello/Agor).

Item D-26: Hale Opio Kauai, Inc. Requests Approval to Amend Settlement and Release Agreement dated December 15, 1999, Civil No. 96-0161, Fifth Circuit Court.

Member Agor recused himself.

Ms. Mamiya pointed out in 1996 Hale Opio Kauai filed a complaint against the State asking for monetary damages and specific performance from the State due the State’s alleged breach of a 1990 Memorandum of Understanding. To avoid the burden, expense, delay and uncertainties of litigation the Department of the Attorney General and Hale Opio negotiated a Settlement and Release Agreement. Ms. Mamiya recommended the Board amend paragraph 4 of the Settlement and Release Agreement by including additional services for children and young adults that are consistent with its policies and goals conforming with best practices as may change from time to time, delete paragraph 5 relating to a time deadline for the use of the funds and except as modified by A and B, the remaining terms and conditions of the Settlement and Release Agreement shall remain in full force and effect.

Unanimously approved as submitted by the remaining Board members (Johns/Yamamura).

Item M-1: Amendment of the Retail Concession Lease (DOT-A-01-003) with DFS Group, L.P. at Honolulu International Airport.
Unanimously approved as submitted (Johns/Yamamura).

Item D-9: Cancellation of Revocable Permit No. S-5716 to Koolauloa Meatoga, and Issuance of Revocable Permit to Brian Meatoga, Lot 1, Block S, Kapaa Town Lots, Kawaihau, Kauai, TMK: (4) 4-5-08:09.

Motion to Withdraw
Unanimously approved to withdraw (Johns/Yamamura).


Motion to Withdraw
Unanimously approved to withdraw (Johns/Martyn).

Item D-18: Issuance of Revocable Permit to Richard Spiegel, dba: Volcano Island Honey Company at Lalamilo, South Kohala, Hawaii, TMK: (3) 6-9-01: por.15.

The Board amended the Recommendation Section by adding subparagraph 1.I to read as follows:

"1.I. Permittee shall comply with Conservation District Use Permit HA-3186."

Unanimously approved as amended (DeMello/Agor).

Item D-22: Grant of Term, Non-Exclusive Easement to Francis and Joyce Tsuzuki for Seawalll Purposes, Kaneohe, Oahu, TMK: (1) 4-4-18:80 sea.

The Board amended the Applicant to read as “Francis I. Tsuzuki and Joyce E. Tsuzuki, husband and wife, Jeffrey I. Tsuzuki, single, and Charlotte C. Higa, a single, as joint tenants.”

Unanimously approved as amended (Johns/Agor).


Item D-3: Amendment to Prior Board Action of September 13, 1996, Agenda Item D-41, Set Aside to City and County of Honolulu, Board of Water Supply by Governor’s Executive Order for Well Purposes, Together with a Waterline Easement at Makua, Hauula, Koolauloa, Oahu, TMK: (1) 5-4-05:01 & 02.
Item D-4: Cancellation of Revocable Permit No. S-4659 to Dr. Tokuso Taniguchi and Grant of Term, Non-Exclusive Easement to Jan T. and Rebecca F. Taniguchi for Access Purposes, Pihonua, South Hilo, Hawaii, TMK: (3) 2-3-26: por. 04.


Item D-6: Issuance of General Lease for Private, Noncommercial Pier to Jeffrey Prostor and Cancellation of Revocable Permit No. S-6697 to Hironori Shimotsu for Recreational Pier, Wailupe, Waikiki, Honolulu, Oahu, TMK: (1) 3-6-01:24 seaward.

Item D-7: Consent to Assign Grant of Non-Exclusive Easement S-5668, Evershine VIII, L.P., Assignor, To Evershine II, L.P., Assignee, Maunalua, Honolulu, Oahu, TMK: (1) 3-9-26:44 seaward.


Item D-14: Grant of 55-year Term Non-Exclusive Easement to Richard E. Reese Revocable Living Trust for Existing Lanai Overhang Purposes, Makiki, Honolulu, Oahu, TMK: (1) 2-5-20: por.02.

Item D-15: Consent to Assign General Lease No. S-5022, Kenichi and Dorothea Nomura, Assignor, to Karl L. Ramirez and Linda M. Alimboyoguen, Assignee, Lot 50, Kokee Camp Site Lots, Waimea, (Kona), Kauai, TMK: (4) 1-4-03:11.
Item D-16: Set Aside to City and County of Honolulu, Department of Parks and Recreation for Public Park Use, Kahaluu, Kaneohe, Oahu, TMK: (1) 4-7-60:29.

Item D-17: Rescind Prior Board Action of November 19, 2004 (Item D-41) Issuance of Term, Non-Exclusive Easement to Kaimana Kai Limited; Grant of Perpetual, Non-Exclusive Easement to Maui Electric Company, Limited and Verizon Hawaii, Inc. for Utility Purposes; Issuance of a Construction Right-of-Entry at Makawao, Maui, TMK: (2) 2-1-6: por.99.


Item D-24: Sale of Reclaimed Land to Donald W. and Virginia D. Thayer; Kaneohe, Koolaupoko, Oahu, TMK: (1) 4-4-37:49 sea.

Item D-25: Cancellation of Governor’s Executive Order No. 2882 and Reset Aside to County of Kauai for Kapaa Baseyard Purposes, por. Kapaa Rice & Kula Lots, Kawaihau, Kauai, TMK: (4) 4-5-15-04.

Item D-27: Amend Prior Board Action of July 30, 2004 under Agenda Item D-16, for Grant of a 55-year Non-Exclusive Easement for Seawall Purposes to the Lily Yee Wong Revocable Living Trust, Kaneohe, Oahu, TMK: (1) 4-9-09:19 seaward and Prior Board Actions for Grant of Easements for Shoreline Encroachments.

Unanimously approved as submitted (Johns/Yamamura).

Item E-2: Acceptance of the Master Plan for Kokee and Waimea Canyon State Parks, and Endorsement of the Preparation of an Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) and Approval to Issue a Request for Qualifications/Request for Proposals (RFQ/RFP) for a Master Lessee to Manage the Recreation Residences in Kokee and Waimea, Canyon state Parks, Waimea, Kauai.

Dan Quinn, Administrator for the Division of State Parks gave some background information on Kokee and Waimea Canyon State Park. He also gave a brief description to the four alternatives and indicated staff’s preferred alternative. Mr. Quinn recommended the Board accept the Draft Master Plan for Kokee and Waimea Canyon State Parks and endorse the preparation of an EIS and authorize the Division of State Parks to issue a Request for
Qualifications/Request for Proposals to find a Master Lessee for the Recreation Residences to follow the General concept of Option 4 - Private Management – Rentals and Short Leases, with details to be refined through the RFQ/RFP process.

Member Johns informed those present based on the testimony received last night he realized how special the Kokee and Waimea Canyon area is. He also made it known that based on those testimony he is not inclined to support an entry gate and a change in the leasehold cabins. He reminded those present that an affirmative vote today would give State Parks the authority to seek additional information on these matters. He also communicated that any fees proposed would need to receive approval from the Board prior to its implementation. He asked staff and the consultants to investigate the different options presented by those testifying at yesterday’s briefing.

Chairperson Young and Member Agor concurred with Member Johns sentiments.

Paul Matsunaga, a lessee told the Board as things stand he is not financial able to renew his lease based on the figures presented by the consultants. He estimated the cost of his lease for one year would be approximately $14,000. Mr. Matsunaga questioned staff’s intension to make Kokee/Waimea Canyon more accessible when the plan before them will be all cabins unaffordable. He asked the board to take into account the testimony of the public and reevaluate the Draft Master Plan.

Janell Hughes spoke in opposition of staff’s recommendation. She let it be known Kokee is a special place because it is open to everyone, there is no entry gate. She stated if the Department established kamaaina rates the local people might be more inclined to go along with an entry gate.

Claire Mortimer spoke against staff’s recommendation and in support of the State issuing discounted rent on the leasehold cabins for residents of the state of Hawaii. She also made it known that the Discovery Center and Camp Sloggett should be reserved for use by the Department of Education. Lastly she stated that gathering rights should be preserved.

Andy Johnston a resident of Kauai for 26 years testified against staff’s recommendation and spoke of how restricted mainland parks that have gates are. He feels wilderness areas and the beaches need little improvement and how it should be kept simple. Mr. Johnston noted his concern with the cabin leases and feels those who presently hold leases to the lots in Kokee should remain there as they have proven themselves as good caretakers of the land but if the State should decide to auction the cabins, the current lessees should get first crack at those leases.

Pat Finberg a 34-year resident of Kauai spoke of her non-profit organization’s goal to perpetuate the Hawaiian culture, restore the land to its original dignity and educate the public. She made the Board aware of the fact that her organization has had a cabin lease for over one hundred years. Ms. Finberg let it be known at the time of the 1985 auction her organization was unaware of the fact that due to their non-profit status together with providing an educational service to the public they were able to conduct direct negotiations with the State
for their lease. She told those in attendance she has since completed the necessary paperwork and will be submitting it to the State.

Julia Nakaya a leaseholder in Kokee spoke of her love for Kokee and her earlier days growing up in Kokee. She spoke of her family’s involvement in the park and their help they’ve provided. Ms. Nakaya spoke of the auction of 1985 and how she believed the State went about the auction the wrong away. She told of how previous lessees got rid of their homes and how those lots to this day have remained unoccupied.

Zachary Davis a resident of Kauai who grew up in Kokee and did volunteer work conveyed his belief that the current leaseholders will do whatever it takes to keep Kokee the way it is. He asked the Board when making a decision to take into considerations the feelings of the people on Kauai.

Frank Hay, President of the Kokee Leaseholders Association reminded the Board their role is to preserve the history of Hawaii. Mr. Hay brought up Chapter 6E, of the Hawaii Revised Statutes under Historic Preservation which states, “It is in the public interest to engage in a comprehensive program of historic preservation for the education, inspiration, pleasure and enrichment of its citizens. It shall be the public policy of this State to provide leadership in preserving, restoring and maintaining historic and cultural property in the spirit of stewardship and trusteeship for future generations.” Mr. Hay believes today’s decision could go one of two ways; to turn Kokee into a resort destination, unaffordable for the Kauai people or to preserved Kokee as a historic and cultural landscape which can be a model for all of Hawaii.

Juan Wilson an architect distributed a drawing of an alternative scheme for the Draft Master Plan. Mr. Wilson’s plan call for an “Aloha – Mahalo” sign to be erected at the beginning of the park. There will be no entry gate, fees or guardhouse. Instead his plan calls for a Ranger Station approximately 100 square feet, which would be operated during daylight hours, and a small emergency parking area would also be created. Mr. Wilson suggested the construction of a new grand lodge, which would offer short-term rentals. As a way of generating income, he suggested the state operate a shuttle service to take people to the trailheads and the Kalalau lookouts. In closing, Mr. Wilson asked the Board to reject staff’s recommendation and go back to the drawing board to come up with a better plan.

John Plews came forward and spoke of the need for maintaining the trails and the increase use it has come under from the public.

Marsha Erickson appeared before the Board and testified of Hui O Laka’s support of the Draft Master Plan. She indicated when making a decision the Board needs to take into consideration the economic benefits of preserving the cultural landscape to the State of Hawaii.

Wayne Jacinto made eleven suggestions in his testimony against the Draft Master Plan. 1) He questioned why a portion of the gasoline tax does not go to improving the roads in Kokee; 2) Charge fees to the leaseholders which could be exchanged for volunteer work; 3) Increase cabin lease rents no more than 50%; 4) Require mandatory membership of all leaseholders in the Kokee Leaseholders Association; 5) Support the leaseholders in their attempt to have the
cabin deemed historical and cultural so they can directly negotiate with the State for new leases; 6) Strike the “surrender clause” and return ownership of the cabins to the lessees; 7) Leave all the leases in private hands and auction off the vacant lots that have been empty since 1985 for newcomers; 8) Construct a new lodge in the meadow for short-term rentals; 9) Adopt the suggestion to increase the rental car surcharge by fifty cents ($ .50) and allot this money to State Parks; 10) Reject the idea of a Master Lessor and 11) Reject the Draft Master Plan.

Benjamin Kali told the Board of his need to protect Kokee’s natural resources for future generations.

David Calahan let it be known those present at the meeting today represent less than one percent of the people of Kauai who oppose the Draft Master Plan. He spoke of various things being taken away from the people and their need to hold on to Kokee and what little things they currently have. Mr. Calahan asked the Board to preserve the land for future generations by rejecting staff’s recommendation.

Donn Carswell a leaseholder came forward to confirm the Board received testimony submitted at the various public hearings.

Canen Hookano conveyed to the Board his desire that the Board take into consideration the testimony they’ve received and remember the people of Kauai when making their decision.

Written testimony was received from Rhoda Libre.

The Board made the following changes:

1. Kokee and Waimea Canyon State Parks Draft Master Plan, Page 6-4 “Features Summary” add the following:
   - Elements of Testimony of the Green Heart Conservation Company

2. Kokee and Waimea Canyon State Parks Draft Master Plan, Page 6-16 “Mission”

   “The Mission of the Division of State Parks is to properly manage and protect Hawaii’s natural and cultural heritage values found within the State Parks system, provide a broad range of outdoor recreation opportunities, [and] promote a safe, high quality park experience for Hawaii’s residents and visitors and preserve Native Hawaiian gathering and cultural access rights.

3. Kokee and Waimea Canyon State Parks Draft Master Plan, Page 7-10 “Entry Gate”

   The Board recommended not having a physical gate and asked staff and the consultants to take into consideration Juan Wilson’s proposal and see how it can be worked into the Master Plan.

- Work with non-profit organizations that rent cabins and provided a substantial amount of public service and consider them separately from individual cabin leases.

5. Kokee and Waimea Canyon State Parks Draft Master Plan, Page 7-20,

Explore the possibility of creating lodge with short-term rentals


“An entry fee may be assessed on a per person or per vehicle basis. A per vehicle fee may encourage visitors to car pool, thus reducing the number of vehicles within the park and correspondingly reduce road and parking congestion, and maintenance requirements. Anyone holding a Hawaii’s drivers license would be exempt from paying any fees.”

Staff and consultants should look at alternate ways of collecting entry fees.

7. Kokee and Waimea Canyon State Parks Draft Master Plan, 7-40 “Recreation Residence Lease Rents”

Take at heart the testimony received on this issue and evaluate it and come up with a workable solution for everyone

8. Look at and evaluate the “Juan Wilson” plan in the Environmental Impact Statement process as well as the comments from Hui O Laka, Wayne Jacintho and Frank Hay with regards to the lease hold issue

9. The Board encouraged staff and the consultants to increase the number of public meetings at various locations around the island with times convenient for the public.

Unanimously approved as amended (Agor/Johns).

Item K-1: Enforcement File No. HA-04-18 Regarding the Alleged Unauthorized Disturbance (grubbing/grading) of 21,000 Square Feet of Geological Features, and Unauthorized Excavation of 315.6 Cubic Yards of Material from the 1960 Kapoho Lava Flow.

Unanimously approved as submitted (Johns/Martyn).

Item E-1: Approval to Contract The Lange Group to provide consultant services for the State Parks Reservation and Visitor Information System (SPRVIS).
Unanimously approved as submitted (Johns/Agor).

Item C-1: Request for Approval to Enter into Contract with Pono Pacific, LLC for Coordination of DLNR Youth Conservation Corps/Americorps Program.

Unanimously approved as submitted (Johns/DeMello).

Item C-2: Establishment of the Kokee Timber Management Area and Approval of the Kokee Timber Management Area Plan.

Marsha Erickson, Executive Director testified in support of staff’s submittal.

Unanimously approved as submitted (Agor/Martyn).

There being no further business, Chairperson Young adjourned the meeting at 10:50 a.m. Tapes of the meeting and all written testimony submitted at the meeting are filed in the Chairperson’s Office and are available for review. Certain items on the agenda were taken out of sequence to accommodate applicants or interested parties present.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry Crowell

Approved for submittal

PETER T. YOUNG
Chairperson
Department of Land and Natural Resources