

SECTION IV: TWO WALLS AT RAILROAD RIGHT-OF-WAY

Numerous questions and theories have been asked and postulated over the last year about walls located adjacent and below the RR ROW in the Southeast Quadrant of the subject property. These walls are shown on the 1984 CSH archeological inventory survey (AIS) site map (see Exhibit A, to the right of "Excluded"). This 1984 AIS identified these walls as historical ranch walls (see Exhibit B) and did not identify any trails on the Property either at that location nor anywhere else. This AIS was approved by SHPD.

These walls were surveyed again in 2016 by Scientific Consultant Services (SCS) and again are clearly visible on the AIS site map (see Exhibit C), and again were identified by SCS in 2016 as historic ranching walls on the 2016 Archeological Sites List (see Exhibit D). This AIS and map were approved by SHPD after a thorough review and analysis.

Subsequently, the State Historic Preservation Division (SHPD) required an updated AIS be done on the entire 68-acre property due to the dated 1984 AIS not being up to current standards, so SCS performed a new AIS on the entire property in 2020. This new AIS of course had a map (see Exhibit E) and Archeological Site List (see Exhibit F). Again, the Map and Site List reference these walls as historic and associated with ranching, and again SHPD approved this report.

In spite of this past work on the walls, there are those that claim these walls are either 1) part of a double-walled ancient trail; or 2) a *hōlua* slide. This Report further investigates the possibility of these walls being a double-walled ancient trail.

We looked at the 1924 USGS Map of the area (see Exhibit G) as it has the most extensive exhibits of walls and trails in this area, but this map showed no walls or trails in this area. We examined many more maps of this land, and none of them showed the two walls or a trail at this location. We found a 1950 aerial photo (see Exhibit H) and the walls are evident on this aerial. Note the subject Property is comprised of the two land tracts labelled Gouveia and Pacheco on Exhibit H, and the walls can be discerned starting just below the RR ROW curve at the mauka Gouveia property line, and the Northern wall runs *makai* for a short distance before it ends. The South wall runs all the way to the molasses sheds/water tank/house on the *makai* Gouveia border on the old Kailua-Keauhou Road. There is an old ranch road along the entire wall, starting on the north side of the north wall to a point where the north wall ends, then the road runs along the north side of the south wall to the *makai* boundary.

This aerial does not clearly show a trail at this location, it certainly appears there is a wall there. The wall does NOT extend *mauka* above the RR ROW nor does it extend *makai* below the Kailua-Keauhou Road. We carefully reviewed site plan view maps and photos of these walls for more data, and found the 2016 AIS plan view map of the two walls at the RR ROW to be helpful (see Exhibit I). This sketch shows both walls meeting with the RR ROW, but according to the separate Escott (2024) Report, the Northern wall is in much better condition and is well-joined at the RR ROW. It is not possible to say if this wall was joined into the RR ROW after the RR was built in 1901, or if it pre-dated the RR. The Southern wall is in poorer shape, and is not well-joined into the RR ROW. There is a wooden fence post at the joiner of the Southern wall with the RR ROW, and there is a length of galvanized water line on the ground near the walls. No trail is noted. Escott's Report notes that the walls are not of similar construction, and that both walls are historic.

A photo of the South wall (see Exhibit J) shows the construction of the wall at the *makai* end, and also shows galvanized waterline pipe on and at the bottom of the wall. Also, a sketch of the South wall by Escott towards the *mauka* end of the wall shows a piece of pipe near the wall. A close review of the 1984 CSH arch map (see Exhibit A) shows that a waterline ran the entire length on the south side of the southern wall from the RR ROW down to the improvements on the Kailua to Keauhou Road. We wondered who put this waterline in?

Investigations of the land ownership records showed that the Project area was part of the Thomas Gouveia Ranch (see Exhibit L). Thomas was a Portuguese immigrant from Madeira who arrived in the late 1890's, and who put together a cattle ranching operation that included the Project lands, which he acquired via a Deed dated 1908 from Commissioner Wall of the Hōlualoa Hui partition. He and his sons ranched these lands into the late 1950's, when they sold the land to Dillingham, and the land continued to be ranched until this very day. So, this land has been ranched for well over 100 years.

Escott's interview of rancher Clarence Rapoza shed some light on the waterline question. Clarence explained that the original ranchers had grazed cattle mainly up above Māmalahoa Highway, where rainfall and therefore grasses were more abundant. He described how ranchers such as Gouveia obtained lands above Māmalahoa Highway which had springs on them, and created storage and transmission systems that allowed them to gather water *mauka* of Māmalahoa and deliver it via pipelines to the *kula* lands and thence to the beach lots at the Kona coast. These waterlines were placed at the base of ranch walls to protect them from the hooves of the cattle. Looking at the map of Gouveia Ranch in the 1930's (Exhibit L), one can see how this water system was put together.

Gouveia owned all the land *makai* of the RR ROW in this area, and almost all the land *mauka* of the RR ROW in this area, up to Way 1 (Alanui Kawila trail) and up to Hualālai Road, including all the land on both sides of Way 7 and Way 8. Gouveia would have run his water line down from up above, across his land or down Ways 6 & 7 to the RR ROW, and crossed the RR ROW and continued the waterline on his property down to service his needs in the *kula* lands.

Once water was brought down to the *kula* lands, the ranchers were able to better graze the cattle, as they could grow grass as well as store molasses made from sugar cane, which was added to food sources as well as fed directly to the cattle to fatten them up. These *kula* lands became ideal land for fattening cattle before shipping once these water resources were established. The 1984 AIS Sites map from Hammatt's survey (see Exhibit M) shows a waterline running just *makai* of the south wall of the two walls all the way to his water tank. A review of Gouveia's Territorial property assessment records (see Exhibit N) showed that he had a dwelling, water tank, and molasses sheds at the bottom of the waterline that ran down the south wall to service his ranching operation. These records show the improvements as having been refurbished in 1941, indicating they were built in the early 1900's, likely after he purchased the lands in 1908.

Glenn Escott has taken the Hōlualoa Hui Sheet 2 Map and overlain the property lines; the RR ROW; the two walls; Kealakowa'a Trail; LCA 3660; and the Gouveia ranch land with the water tank/molasses sheds/home on it (see Exhibit O) to illustrate the relative locations of each feature. Note that the two walls and Way #7 do **not** align.

Since Way #7 and the two walls do not align, it appears that there was no continuation of the Way #7 trail (built in the late 1800's/early 1900's as part of the Hōlualoa Hui Partition to provide access to Lots 47-52 inclusive of said Partition) across the RR ROW and onto Gouveia's *kula* lands *makai* of the RR ROW. The lack of connectivity between Way #7 and the walls is further reinforced by a review of the

history of Way #7. An archeological study performed by Rechtman for SHPD and Nā Ala Hele on Way #5 (mauka of Ways #6 & #7, and described by Goro Inaba as Hōlualoa Trail) showed a map of the trail (see Exhibit P) and provided a picture of said trail (see Exhibit Q). The trail was consistently about 10.5 feet wide and had walls averaging 3.5 feet in height.

Below Way #5 and above Way #7, between Hualālai Road and Way 1 (Alanui Kawila trail) lies Way 6. Escott's report describes Way 6 thusly: "The corridor is narrower than that of Way #5 and the walls of Way #6 are lower and are constructed differently than those of Way #5. The walls are constructed of small boulders stacked three to four courses high. There is level concrete along the top of the north wall. The wall construction is similar to late Historic era to modern rock wall construction."

Glenn Escott's investigation of the two walls *makai* of the RR ROW (see Exhibit R) showed the walls are about 20'-30' apart, much wider than either Way #5 or Way #6. The two walls are of dissimilar construction, and are different in height with the north wall being about 3.5 feet high but the south wall being shorter. His report affirms both of the walls are historic. In addition, the elevation drop at the RR ROW makes it impassable from Way #7, and the ground area between the two walls is unfinished, with lava outcrops and loose rock making the ground impassable to anything but foot traffic.

Finally, a close inspection of the Hōlualoa Hui Sheet 1 Map (see Exhibit O); the 1924 USGS Map (see Exhibit G) and the Bauer 1928 Strip Map (see Exhibit S) shows that **none** of these maps show any trail *makai* of the RR ROW in the area of these two walls.

Conclusion: All evidence found points to the two walls being historic cattle features that served ranching purposes on the Gouveia Ranch. The south wall also served as protection for the water line that Gouveia ran down the mountainside to serve his cattle businesses. Based on an interview with rancher Joe Gomes, the original Kona water transmission system was developed by the sugar refinery (built in 1898), and this Gouveia water transmission system could very well have been the second system in Kona. The walls above and below the RR ROW are not aligned, and are of dissimilar construction. There is no physical evidence of a trail, either historic or pre-contact, between the walls, but there is a ranch road on the north side of the north wall. There are no maps we could find that show a trail at this location. We could find no reference to trails in this location in any of the three SHPD approved AIS studies done on this area, nor on any government maps or land documents.

Without any contrary evidence, there is no reason to believe this area had any pre-contact or pre-1892 trail or road, nor is this area subject to the 1892 Highways Act.

SECTION IV: LIST OF EXHIBITS

- A) 1984 CSH Arch Site Map
- B) 1984 Arch Site Inventory List
- C) SCS 5-ac Arch Site Map
- D) SCS 5-ac Arch Site Inventory List
- E) SCS 76-ac Arch Site Map
- F) SCS 76-ac Arch Site Inventory List
- G) 1924 USGS Map
- H) 1950 Aerial Photo
- I) Two Walls at RR ROW sketch
- J) S Wall with galvanized water line pic
- K) S wall with galvanized waterline sketch
- L) Gouveia Ranch lands-1930's
- M) 1984 AIS Map with waterline
- N) Gouveia assessor records
- O) Hōlualoa Hui Sheet 1 Markup
- P) Hōlualoa Grant Road Map
- Q) Hōlualoa Grant Road Pic
- R) Two Walls pic
- S) Bauer 1928 Strip Map